



VOLUME 49

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

Special Tribunal
for Lebanon
2009-2013

André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.)
Anzinga Low (assistant editor)

CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	11
Part I/ Preliminary Matters	
1. Pre-Trial Detention	
Order on Conditions of Detention, <i>In the Matter of El Sayed</i> , Case No. CH/PRES/2009/01/rev, Before the President, 21 April 2009.	13
Order Regarding the Detention of Persons Detained in Lebanon in Connection with the Case of the Attack against Prime Minister Rafiq Hariri and Others, <i>In the Matter of El Sayed</i> , Case No. CH/PTJ/2009/06, Before the Pre-Trial Judge, 29 April 2009.	21
Commentary <i>Denis Abels</i>	29
2. Deferral and Cooperation	
Order Directing the Lebanese Judicial Authority Seized with the Case of the Attack Against Prime Minister Rafiq Hariri and Others to Defer to the Special Tribunal for Lebanon, <i>In the Matter of El Sayed</i> , Case No. CH/PTJ/2009/01, Before the Pre-Trial Judge, 27 March 2009.	35
Decision on the Defence Request Seeking to Obtain the Cooperation of Lebanon, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash, et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-011/PT/PTJ, P.T. Ch., 11 February 2013.	41
Decision on Defence Motion to Stay the Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-011/PT/TC, T. Ch., 17 December 2013.	47
Commentary <i>Marjolein Cupido</i>	54
3. Legality of the Tribunal	
Decision on the Defence Challenges to the Jurisdiction and Legality of the Tribunal, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case. No. STL-11-01/PT/TC, T. Ch., 27 July 2012.	63
Decision on the Defence Appeals Against the Trial Chamber's "Decision on the Defence Challenges to the Jurisdiction and Legality of the Tribunal", <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC/AR90.1, A. Ch., 24 October 2012.	83
Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Baragwanath	99
Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Riachy	118
Commentary <i>Maartje Krabbe</i>	122
4. Applicable Law	
Interlocutory Decision on the Applicable Law: Terrorism, Conspiracy, Homicide, Perpetration, Cumulative Charging, with corrected front page, Before the Appeals Chamber, Case No. STL-11-01/1, A. Ch., 16 February 2011.	129
Corrected version of Decision on the Pre-Trial Judge's Request Pursuant to Rule 68(G), <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash, et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC, A. Ch., 29 March 2012.	223
Separate Opinion of Judge Chamseddine	233
Decision on Defence Requests for Reconsideration of the Appeals Chamber's Decision of 16 February 2011, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC/R176bis, A. Ch., 18 July 2012.	235
Commentary <i>André Klip</i>	249

8. Disclosure, not related to El Sayed

Decision Relating to the Prosecution Request Seeking Measures for the Non-Dissemination of Material of 2 May 2012, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PTJ, P.T. Ch., 25 May 2012. 619

Decision on the Sabra Defence’s First, Second, Third, Fourth, Fifth and Sixth Motions for Disclosure, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PTJ, P.T. Ch., 8 November 2012. 633

Decision on the Prosecution Request Seeking Interim Protective Measures for the Expert Witnesses, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PTJ, P.T. Ch., 13 December 2012. 647

Public Redacted Version of 19 September 2013 Decision on Appeal by Counsel for Mr Oncissi Against Pre-Trial Judge’s “Decision on Issues Related to the Inspection Room and Call Data Records”, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC/ARI26.4, A. Ch., 2 October 2013. 657

Commentary *Alexander Heinze*. 670

9. Procedural Matters

Order Relating to the Jurisdiction of the Tribunal to Rule on the Application by Mr El Sayed Dated 17 March 2010 and Whether Mr El Sayed Has Standing Before the Tribunal, *In the Matter of El Sayed*, Case No. CH/PTJ/2010/005, Before the Pre-Trial Judge, 17 September 2010 679

Decision on the Application to Challenge the Order of the President of the Appeals Chamber to Stay the Order of the Pre-Trial Judge and to Call Upon Amicus Curiae, *In the Matter of El Sayed*, Case No. CH-AC-2010-01, A. Ch., 8 November 2010 693

Decision on Appeal of Pre-Trial Chamber Judge’s Order Regarding Jurisdiction and Standing, *In the Matter of El Sayed*, Case No. CH-AC-2010-01, A. Ch., 10 November 2010 701

Decision on Languages in the Case of *Ayyash et al.*, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PTJ, P.T. Ch., 16 September 2011 717

Decision on the Prosecution’s Request for Partial Reconsideration of the Pre-Trial Judge’s Order of 8 February 2012, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PTJ, Before the Pre-Trial Judge, 29 March 2012. 731

Decision on the Motion by the Defence for Mr. Mustafa Badreddine to have the Indictment of 10 June 2011, Confirmed on 28 June 2011, Annulled on the Grounds of Absence of Authority, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PTJ, Before the Pre-Trial Judge, 29 August 2012. 739

Decision on Appeal Against Pre-Trial Judge’s Decision on Motion by Counsel for Mr Badreddine Alleging the Absence of Authority of the Prosecutor, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC/ARI26.2, A. Ch., 13 November 2012 745

Decision Relating to the Requests for Certification of the Decisions of 25 October 2012 and 15 November 2012, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PTJ, P.T. Ch., 19 December 2012. 751

Decision on Defence Motion for Reconsideration and Rescission of Order Composing the Trial Chamber, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PRES, Before the President, 4 October 2013. 759

Decision on Application by Counsel for Messrs Badreddine and Oneissi against President’s Order on Composition of the Trial Chamber of 10 September 2013, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC, A. Ch., 25 October 2013 763

Decision on Request by Defence for Messrs Badreddine and Oneissi for Authorization to Seek Reconsideration of the Appeals Chamber’s Decision of 25 October 2013, *Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.*, Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC, A. Ch., 13 November 2013 769

Decision on Request by Counsel for Messrs Badreddine and Oneissi for Reconsideration of the Appeals Chamber’s Decision of 25 October 2013, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC, A. Ch., 10 December 2013.	775
Commentary <i>Karel De Meester</i>	781

10. In Absentia

Order to Seize the Trial Chamber Pursuant to Rule 105 bis (A) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence in Order to Determine Whether to Initiate Proceedings in Absentia, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/1, P.T. Ch., 17 October 2011	783
Decision to Hold Trial in Absentia, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/1/TC, T. Ch., 1 February 2012	789
Decision on Reconsideration of the Trial in Absentia Decision, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/1/TC, T. Ch., 11 July 2012	815
Corrected Version of Decision on Defence Appeals Against Trial Chamber’s Decision on Reconsideration of the Trial In Absentia Decision, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/AC/AR126.1, A. Ch., 1 November 2012.	825
Decision to Hold Trial in Absentia, <i>Prosecutor v. Merhi</i> , Case No. STL-13-04/1/TC, T. Ch., 20 December 2013	847
Commentary <i>Michele Caianiello and Maria Laura Ferioli</i>	871

11. Witnesses

Decision on Compliance with the Practice Direction for the Admissibility of Witness Statements under Rule 155, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/1/TC, T. Ch., 30 May 2013.	883
First Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Admission of Written Statements Under Rule 155, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/1/TC, T. Ch., 20 December 2013	891
Commentary <i>Miodrag Majić</i>	904

12. Impartiality

Decision on Mr El Sayed’s Motion for the Disqualification of Judge Riachy from the Appeals Chamber Pursuant to Rule 25, <i>In the Matter of El Sayed</i> , Case No. CH/PRES/2010/08, Before the President, 5 November 2010.	913
Decision on Mr El Sayed’s Motion for the Disqualification of Judge Chamseddine from the Appeals Chamber Pursuant to Rule 25, <i>In the Matter of El Sayed</i> , Case No. CH/PRES/2010/08, Before the President, 5 November 2010.	929
Commentary <i>Gerardine Goh Escolar</i>	935

13. Duty Counsel

Corrected Version of the “Decision Relating to the Assignment of ‘Duty Counsel’ by the Head of Defence Office”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/1/TC, T. Ch., 2 November 2011	943
Decision on “Observations du Bureau de la défense” of 22 December 2011, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/1/TC, T. Ch., 13 January 2012	947
Decision of President on Forum and Redactions, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PRES, Before the President, 25 September 2012	951
Public Redacted Version of Second Interim Decision Filed Confidentially on 10 September 2012, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PRES, Before the President, 8 October 2012.	955

Contents

Decision on Forum for Review of the Registrar's Decision in Relation to the Assignment of a Local Resource Person, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PTJ, P.T. Ch., 9 November 2012.....	965
Decision on the Head of Defence Office Request for Review of the Registrar's Decision Relating to the Assignment of a Local Resource Person, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PRES, Before the President, 21 December 2012.....	973
Decision on the Registry Application Pursuant to Rule 48(C) Seeking Clarification and Relief Regarding the President's Decision of 21 December 2012, <i>Prosecutor v. Ayyash et al.</i> , Case No. STL-11-01/PT/PRES, Before the President, 27 March 2013.....	985
Commentary <i>Monique Oudt</i>	995
Contributors and Editors	1001