



# Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

Extraordinary Chambers  
in the Courts of Cambodia  
2007-2010

André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.)  
Anzinga Low (assistant editor)



intersentia

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Preface</b> .....	11
<b>Part 1/ Issues Relating to Provisional Detention</b>	
Order of Provisional Detention, <i>Investigation against Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/14-08-2006, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 14 November 2007 .....	13
Decision on Appeal against Provisional Detention Order of Kaing Guek Eav alias “DUCH”, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007-ECCC-OCIJ (PTC01), P.T. Ch., 3 December 2007 .....	19
Decision on Appeal against Provisional Detention Order of Nuon Chea, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC01), P.T. Ch., 20 March 2008 .....	31
Report of Examination, <i>Investigation against Ieng Thirith</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC02), Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 20 May 2008 .....	49
Decision on Nuon Chea’s Appeal concerning Provisional Detention Conditions, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC09), P.T. Ch., 26 September 2008 .....	59
Decision on Appeal against Provisional Detention Order of Ieng Sary, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC03), P.T. Ch., 17 October 2008 .....	65
Decision on Ieng Thirith’s Appeal against Order on Extension of Provisional Detention, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Thirith</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC16), P.T. Ch., 11 May 2009 .....	85
Decision on Khieu Samphan’s Appeals against Order Refusing Request for Release and Extension of Provisional Detention Order, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 14 and 15), P.T. Ch., 3 July 2009 .....	97
Order on Extension of Provisional Detention, <i>Investigation against Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-OCIJ, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 18 November 2009 .....	123
<i>Commentary</i> Iryna Marchuk .....	131
<b>Part 2/ Requests for Release</b>	
Order Refusing Request for Release, <i>Investigation against Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/14-08-2006, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 28 October 2008 .....	141
Decision on Khieu Samphan’s Supplemental Application for Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC15), P.T. Ch., 24 December 2008 .....	149
Decision on Request for Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 15 June 2009 .....	153
<i>Commentary</i> Artur Appazov .....	163
<b>Part 3/ Requests for Annulment of Proceedings</b>	
Decision on Nuon Chea’s Appeal against Order Refusing Request for Annulment, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC06), P.T. Ch., 26 August 2008 .....	171

Decision on Khieu Samphan's Appeal against the Order on the Request for Annulment for Abuse of Process, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC30), P.T. Ch., 4 May 2010 .....	179
Decision on Ieng Thirith's Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges Order Rejecting the Request to (sic) Seize the Pre-Trial Chamber with a view to Annulment of all Investigations (D263/1), <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Thirith</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC41), P.T. Ch., 25 June 2010 .....	185
<i>Commentary</i> Freya Baetens, Aiste Dumbryste, Nivedita S, Anda Scarlat .....	200
<b>Part 4/ Orders for Investigative Action / Powers of Co-Investigative Judges</b>	
Decision on Ieng Sary's Appeal against Letter concerning Request for Information concerning Legal Officer David Boyle, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIL (PTC08), P.T. Ch., 28 August 2008 .....	209
Order on Request for Investigative Action, <i>Investigation against Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-OCIJ, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 3 April 2009 .....	213
Decision on Admissibility on "Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges' Order on Breach of Confidentiality of the Judicial Investigation", <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 18), P.T. Ch., 13 July 2009 .....	217
Decision on Appeal against Co-Investigating Judges' Order on the Charged Person's Eleventh Request for Investigative Action, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC21), P.T. Ch., 18 August 2009 .....	225
Order on the Request by the Ieng Sary Defence Team for Sanctions against the Co-Prosecutors, <i>Investigation against Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-OCIJ, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 26 November 2009 .....	233
Order on Request for Investigative Action concerning Forced Marriages and Forced Sexual Relations, <i>Investigation</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-OCIJ, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 18 December 2009 .....	237
Decision on Admissibility of the Appeal against Co-Investigating Judges' Order on Use of Statements which were or may have been Obtained by Torture, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Thirith</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC26), P.T. Ch., 18 December 2009 .....	243
Order on Civil Party Request for Investigative Action concerning Enforced Disappearance, <i>Investigation against Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-OCIJ, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 21 December 2009 .....	251
Combined Order on Co-Prosecutors' Two Requests for Investigative Action regarding Khmer Krom and Mass Executions in Bakan District (Pursat) and the Civil Parties Request for Supplementary Investigations regarding Genocide of the Khmer Krom & the Vietnamese, <i>Investigation against Nuon Chea et al.</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-OCIJ, 13 January 2010 .....	255
Decision on Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges' Order Issuing Warnings under Internal Rule 38, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 56), P.T. Ch., 7 June 2010 .....	259
Decision on Ieng Sary's Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges' Order on Ieng Sary's Motion against the Application of Command Responsibility, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 60), P.T. Ch., 9 June 2010 .....	265

Decision on Appeal against OCIJ Order on Nuon Chea’s Eighteenth Request for Investigative Action, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECC-OCIJ (PTC 58), P.T. Ch., 10 June 2010 .....	271
Decision on the Appeal against the ‘Order on the Request to Place on the Case [File] the Documents relating to Mr. Khieu Samphan’s Real Activity’, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC63), P.T. Ch., 7 July 2010 .....	281
<i>Commentary</i> Robert Heinsch .....	290
<b>Part 5/ Rights of the Accused</b>	
Decision relating to Notice of Withdrawal of Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC04), P.T. Ch., 15 October 2008 .....	303
Decision on Khieu Samphan’s Appeal against the Order on Translation Rights and Obligations of the Parties, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC11), P.T. Ch., 20 February 2009 .....	307
Decision on Admissibility of Ieng Sary’s Appeal against the OCIJ’s Constructive Denial of Ieng Sary’s Requests concerning the OCIJ’s Identification of and Reliance on Evidence Obtained through Torture, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC31), P.T. Ch., 10 May 2010 .....	317
Decision on Ieng Sary’s Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges’ Order Denying Request to Allow Audio/Video Recording of Meetings with Ieng Sary at the Detention Facility, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 64), P.T. Ch., 11 June 2010 .....	325
Decision on Ieng Thirith Defence Appeal against ‘Order on Requests for Investigative Action by the Defence for Ieng Thirith’ of 15 March 2010, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Thirith</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 62), P.T. Ch., 14 June 2010 .....	337
Decision on Nuon Chea’s Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges’ Order Rejecting Request for a Second Expert Opinion, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECC/OCIJ (PTC 66), P.T. Ch., 1 July 2010 .....	351
<i>Commentary</i> Andreas Laursen .....	329
<b>Part 6/ Rights relating to Civil Parties</b>	
Decision on Civil Party Participation in Provisional Detention Appeals, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC01), P.T. Ch., 20 March 2008 .....	365
Decision of Application for Reconsideration of Civil Party’s Right to Address Pre-Trial Chamber in Person, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC03), P.T. Ch., 28 August 2008 .....	379
Decision on Unrepresented Civil Parties’ Right to Address the Pre-Trial Chamber in Person, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC03), P.T. Ch., 29 August 2008 .....	385
Order on Civil Party Lawyer’s request for Designation of Interpreter, <i>Investigation against Chea</i> , Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 31 December 2008 .....	389
Decision on Request to Extend Deadline for the Filing of Civil Party Applications, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 10 March 2009 .....	393

Motion regarding Deceased Civil Party, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-C/TC, T. Ch., 13 March 2009 .....	397
the Request of the Co-Lawyers for Civil Parties Group 2 to make an Opening Statement Substantive Hearing, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, Trial Chamber I, 13 March 2009 .....	401
Protective Measures for Civil Parties, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-C/TC, T. Ch., 2 June 2009 .....	405
Civil Party Co-Lawyers' Joint Request for a Ruling on the Standing of Civil Party Submissions on Sentencing and Directions concerning the Questioning of the Experts and Witnesses Testifying on Character, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 9 October 2009 .....	411
Opinion of Judge Lavergne .....	419
the Appeals filed by Lawyers for Civil Parties (Groups 2 and 3) against the Trial Chamber's Decision of 27 August 2009, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, Trial Chamber I, 24 December 2009 .....	429
Appeals against Co-Investigating Judges' Combined Order D250/3 dated 13 January 2010 and Order D250/32 dated 13 January 2010 on Admissibility of Civil Party Applications, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Thirith, Ieng Sary, Khieu Samphan, Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC05), P.T. Ch., 27 April 2010 .....	433
Judges Ney Thol, Catherine Marchi-Uhel and Huot Vuthy .....	453
Judges Prak Kimsan and Rowan Dowling .....	456
Prosecutor Agata Helena Skora .....	460
<b>Visitation Rights</b>	
the Admissibility of the Appeal lodged by Ieng Sary on Visitation Rights, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC05), P.T. Ch., 21 March 2008 .....	467
Appeal Concerning Contact between the Charged Person and his Wife, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC05), P.T. Ch., 30 April 2008 .....	471
Prosecutor Pernille Walther .....	475
<b>Liability of Joint Criminal Enterprise Doctrine</b>	
the Application at the ECCC of the Form of Liability known as Joint Criminal Enterprise, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Thirith, Ieng Sary, and Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC-OCIJ, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 8 December 2009 .....	479
the Appeals against the Co-Investigating Judges Order on Joint Criminal Enterprise, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Thirith, Ieng Sary, and Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC38), P.T. Ch., 20 May 2010 .....	487
Prosecutor Astrid Kjeldgaard-Pedersen .....	525

Decision on Admissibility of Material on the Case File as Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 26 May 2009 .....	535
Decision on Group 1–Civil Parties’ Co-Lawyers’ Request that the Trial Chamber Facilitate the Disclosure of an UN-OIOS Report to the Parties, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 23 September 2009 .....	541
Decision on Parties Requests to Put Certain Materials Before the Chamber Pursuant to Internal Rule 87(2), <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 28 October 2009 .....	547
Decision on the Appeal from the Order on the Request to seek Exculpatory Evidence in the Shared Materials Drive, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan, Ieng Thirith, Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC24), P.T. Ch., 18 November 2009 .....	553
Decision on Co-Prosecutors’ Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges Order on Request to place Additional Evidentiary Material on the Case File which Assists in Proving the Charged Persons’ Knowledge of the Crimes, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea, Ieng Sary, Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC67), P.T. Ch., 15 June 2010 .....	565
Order in Response to the Decision of the Pre-Trial Chamber on Co-Prosecutors’ Appeal against the Co-Investigating Judges Order on Request to place Additional Evidentiary Material on the Case File which Assists in Proving the Charged Persons’ Knowledge of the Crimes, <i>Investigation against Nuon Chea et al.</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ, Office of the Co-Investigating Judges, 21 June 2010 .....	573
<i>Commentary</i> Nobuo Hayashi .....	576
<b>Part 10/ Appointment of Experts</b>	
Decision on Ieng Sary’s Appeal regarding the Appointment of a Psychiatric Expert, <i>Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC10), P.T. Ch., 21 October 2008 .....	597
Decision on Nuon Chea’s Appeal regarding Appointment of an Expert, <i>Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC07), P.T. Ch., 22 October 2008 .....	605
<i>Commentary</i> Sarah Williams .....	612
<b>Part 11/ Third Party Interventions</b>	
Decision on Ieng Sary’s Request to make Submissions on the Application of the Theory of Joint Criminal Enterprise in the Co-Prosecutors’ Appeal of the Closing Order against Kaing Guek Eav “Duch”, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC02), P.T. Ch., 6 October 2008 .....	617
Decision on Khieu Samphan’s Request for a Public Hearing, <i>Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan</i> , Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC11), P.T. Ch., 4 November 2008 .....	621
Decision on Urgent Joint Defence Request to Intervene on the issue of Joint Criminal Enterprise in the OCP Appeal against the Duch Closing Order, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC02), P.T. Ch., 5 November 2008 .....	625
Decision on Ieng Sary’s Request to make Submissions in Response to the Co-Prosecutors’ Request for the Application of Joint Criminal Enterprise, <i>Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav</i> , Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 3 July 2009 .....	627
<i>Commentary</i> Hala El Amine and Mael Daniel .....	630

**Part 12/ Misconduct of Lawyer**

Warning to International Co-Lawyer, *Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan*, Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 14 and 15), P.T. Ch., 19 May 2009 ..... 641

*Commentary* Monique Oudt ..... 648

**Part 13/ Requests for Disqualification of Judges / Claims of Lack of Independence of Court**

Public Decision on the Co-Lawyers’ Urgent Application for Disqualification of Judge Ney Thol pending the Appeal against the Provisional Detention Order in the case of Nuon Chea, *Prosecutor v. Nuon Chea*, Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC01), P.T. Ch., 4 February 2008 ..... 653

Decision on the Charged Person’s Application for Disqualification of Drs. Stephen Heder and David Boyle, *Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary*, Case No. 002/08-07-2009-ECCC-PTC, P.T. Ch., 22 September 2009 ..... 689

Decision on Ieng Sary’s Request for Appropriate Measures concerning Certain Statements by Prime Minister Hun Sen Challenging the Independence of Pre-Trial Chamber Judges Katinka Lahuis and Rowan Downing, *Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary*, Case No. 002/20-10-2009-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC 03), P.T. Ch., 30 November 2009 ..... 665

Decision on Khieu Samphan’s Application to Disqualify Co-Investigating Judge Marcel Lemonde, *Prosecutor v. Khieu Samphan*, Case No. 002/13-10-2009-ECCC/PTC (02), P.T. Ch., 14 December 2009 ..... 671

Decision on Ieng Sary’s and on Ieng Thirith Applications under Rule 34 to Disqualify Judge Marcel Lemonde, *Prosecutor v. Ieng Sary, Ieng Thirith, Nuon Chea*, Case No. 002/11-12-2009-ECCC/PTC (07), P.T. Ch., 15 June 2010 ..... 679

*Commentary* Gérardine Goh Escolar ..... 693

**Part 14/ Appeal Against Closing Orders**

Decision on Appeal against Closing Order Indicting Kaing Guek Eav alias “Duch”, *Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav*, Case No. 001/18-07-2007-ECCC/OCIJ (PTC02), P.T. Ch., 5 December 2008 .... 703

*Commentary* Manuel Ventura ..... 731

**Part 15/ Judgement**

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav*, Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 26 July 2010 ..... 747

Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Jean-Marc Lavergne on Sentencing, *Prosecutor v. Kaing Guek Eav*, Case No. 001/18-07-2007/ECCC/TC, T. Ch., 26 July 2010 ..... 913

*Commentary* Carrie McDougall ..... 916

**Contributors and Editors** ..... 931