



V O L U M E

# **Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals**

**The International  
Criminal Tribunal  
for Rwanda 2005-2006**

**André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)**



intersentia

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents .....	5
Preface .....	.11
 <i>Part 1/ Preliminary matters</i>	
 1. Referral	
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Referral to the Kingdom of Norway (Rule <i>Wbis</i> of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-86-R116 <sub>6</sub> s, T. Ch. III, 19 May 2006. ....	13
Decision on Rule <i>Ubis</i> Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagaragaza</i> , Case No. ICTR-05-86~AR116/s, A. Ch., 30 August 2006. ....	19
Commentary <i>Isodoro Blanco Cordero</i> . ....	25
 2. Joint Criminal Enterprise	
Decision on Jerome Bicamumpaka's Request for a Declaration that the Indictment Does not Allege that He is Liable for any Form of Joint Criminal Enterprise (Rules 72 (A) (ii), 72 (G), and 73 (A) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 23 March 2006. ....	31
Decision on Jurisdictional Appeals: Joint Criminal Enterprise, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR72.5, ICTR-98-44-AR72.6, A. Ch., 12 April 2006. ....	37
Decision on Defence Motions Challenging the Pleading of a Joint Criminal Enterprise in a Count of Complicity in Genocide in the Amended Indictment (Articles 2 and 6(1) of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 18 May 2006. ....	45
Separate Opinion of Judge Short on Complicity in Genocide and Joint Criminal Enterprise Theory (Articles 2 and 6(1) of the Statute and Rule 72 of the Rules of Procedure of Evidence), 23 May 2006. ....	49
Decision Pursuant to Rule 72(E) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence on Validity of the Prosecution Appeal Regarding the Pleading of Joint Criminal Enterprise in a Count of Complicity in Genocide, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR72.7, A.Ch., 14 July 2006. ....	55
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Schomburg. ....	59
Commentary <i>Helmut Satzger</i> . ....	61
 3. Joinder/ severance	
Decision on Request for Severance of Three Accused, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi<sup>^</sup> Ntahakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 27 March 2006. ....	69

Decision on Severance or Exclusion of Evidence Based on Prejudice Arising from Testimony of Jean Kambanda, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze, Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. L, 11 September 2006. . . . . 75

Commentary *Ousman Njikam*. . . . . 81

**Part 11 Procedural matters**

**4. Disclosure and other evidentiary matters**

Decision on Admissibility of Newspaper Article and Subpoena to Journalist, *Prosecutor v. Karera*. Case No. ICTR-01-74-T, T. Ch. I, 23 January 2006. . . . . 85

Decision on Defence Motions for Disclosure of Information Obtained from Juvenal Uwilingiyimana (Rules 66(B) and 68(A) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), *Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 27 April 2006. . . . . 89

Decision on Kanyabashi's Oral Motion to Cross-Examine Ntahobali Using Ntahobali's Statements to Prosecution Investigators in July 1997, *Prosecutor v. Ndayambaje* (Case No. ICTR-96-8-T), *Prosecutor v. Kanyahashi* (Case No. ICTR-96-15-T), *Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali* (Case No. ICTR-97-21-T) and *Prosecutor v. Nsabimana and Nteziryayo* (Case No. ICTR-97-29-T), Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 15 May 2006. . . . . 95

Decision on Ntabakuze Motion for Exclusion of Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 29 June 2006. . . . . 109

Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Regarding the Role of the Prosecutor's Electronic Disclosure Suite in Discharging Disclosure Obligations, *Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73.7, A. Ch., 30 June 2006. . . . . 125

Decision on the Defence Motion for Disclosure of Exculpatory Information with Respect to Prior Statements of Prosecution Witnesses, *Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo*, Case No. ICTR-2001-73-T, T. Ch. III, 6 July 2006. . . . . 131

Decision on Kabiligi Motion for Exclusion of Evidence, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 4 September 2006. . . . . 137

Commentary *Ignaz Stegmler*. . . . . 145

**5. Witnesses, counsel and fair trial**

Decision on Arséne Shalom Ntahobali's Extremely Urgent-Strictly Confidential - Under Seal - Motion to Have Witness NMBMP Testify via Video-Link, *Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali*, Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 2 March 2006 . . . . 153

Decision on Ntahobali's Strictly Confidential Motion to Recall Witnesses TN, QBQ, and QY, for Additional Cross-Examination (Rule 54, 73(A), 90(G), Rules of Procedure and Evidence), *Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali*, Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 3 March 2006. . . . . 159

Decision on Motion for Further Alibi Particulars, *Prosecutor v. Karera*, Case No. ICTR-01-74-T, T. Ch. I, 7 March 2006. . . . . 173

Decision on Nyiramasuhuko's Motion for Separate Proceedings, a New Trial, and Stay of Proceedings (Rules 82(B) and 72(D), Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 7 April 2006. . . . .	177
Decision on Urgent Motion for the Deposition of Joseph Serugendo, <i>Prosecutor v. Serugendo</i> , Case No. ICTR-05-84-I, T. Ch. I, 8 June 2006. . . . .	197
Decision on Request to Direct Registry to Comply with Order Concerning Witness Protection, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 3 July 2006. . . . .	201
Review of the Registrar's Decision Denying Request for Withdrawal of Co-Counsel, <i>Barayagwiza v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, Pres., 29 August 2006. . . . .	205
Commentary <i>Michele Caianiello</i> . . . . .	208
 6. Scope of the appeal	
Decision on Motion for Reconsideration Concerning Standards for Granting Certification of Interlocutory Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 16 February 2006. . . . .	215
Reconsideration of Oral Ruling of 1 June 2005 on Evidence Relating to the Crash of the Plane Carrying President Habyarimana, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-56-T, T. Ch. II, 23 February 2006. . . . .	219
Decision on Justin Mugenzi's Application for Certification to Appeal the Trial Chamber's Decision on Defence Motions Pursuant to Rule 98bis (Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 20 March 2006. . . . .	223
Decision on Certification of Interlocutory Appeal Concerning Prosecution Disclosure of Defence Witness Statements, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 22 May 2006. . . . .	227
Decision on Appellant Jean-Bosco Barayagwiza's Motion Requesting Examination of the Defence Motion Dated 28 July 2000 and Remedy for Abuse of Process, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 23 June 2006. . . . .	231
Decision on Appellant Jean-Bosco Barayagwiza's Motions for Leave to Submit Additional Grounds of Appeal, to Amend the Notice of Appeal and to Correct his Appellant's Brief, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 17 August 2006. . . . .	241
Decision on "Prosecutor's Motion for Variation of Notice of Appeal Pursuant to Rule 108", <i>Simba v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-76-A, A. Ch., 17 August 2006. . . . .	257
Commentary <i>Goreth Kyakuwa</i> . . . . .	263
 7. Judicial notice	
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Judicial Notice (Rule 94 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-R94, T. Ch. III, 9 November 2005. . . . .	271

Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Judicial Notice Pursuant to Rules 73(A), 94(A) and 89 of the Rules and Article 7 of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Nindiliyimana, Nzuwonemeye and Sagahutu</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-56-T, T. Ch. II, 6 December 2005. . . . .	277
Decision on Prosecutor's interlocutory Appeal of Decision on Judicial Notice, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR73(C), A. Ch., 16 June 2006 . . . . .	283
Commentary <i>Marloes Kleijn Hesselink</i> . . . . .	299
<b>8. Cooperation of states</b>	
Decision on Nzuwonemeye's Motion Requesting the Cooperation from the Government of the Netherlands Pursuant to Article 28 of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Nindiliyimana, Nzuwonemeye and Sagahutu</i> , Case No, ICTR-00-56-T, T. Ch. II, 13 February 2006. . . . .	305
Decision on Defence Motion to Report Government of a Certain State to United Nations Security Council and on Prosecution Motions under Rule 66(C) of the Rules (Article 28 of the Statute of the Tribunal and Rule 66(C) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-R94, T. Ch. III, 15 February 2006. . . . .	309
Decision on Request for a Subpoena, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsenyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 11 September 2006. . . . .	315
Commentary <i>Micaela Frulli</i> . . . . .	319
<b>Part 3/ Judgement and sentencing</b>	
<b>9. Judgements</b>	
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Simba</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-76-T, T. Ch. I, 13 December 2005. . . . .	325
Commentary <i>Gerhard Kemp</i> . . . . .	421
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bisengimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-60-T, T. Ch. II, 13 April 2006. . . . .	429
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Serugendo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-84-I, T. Ch. I, 12 June 2006. . . . .	471
Commentary <i>Eric Iverson</i> . . . . .	490
Judgement. <i>Gacumbitsi v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. Case No. ICTR-2001-64-A, A. Ch., 7 July 2006 . . . . .	495
Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen. . . . .	547
Joint Separate Opinion of Judges Liu and Meron. . . . .	560
Separate Opinion of Judge Schomburg on the Criminal Responsibility of the Appellant for Committing Genocide. . . . .	563
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Güney. . . . .	571
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Meron. . . . .	574
Commentary <i>Anne-Marie de Brouwer</i> . . . . .	583
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntagerura, Bagambiki and Imanishimwe</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-46-A, A. Ch., 7 July 2006. . . . .	595
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Schomburg . . . . .	693

Commentary <i>Dov Jacobs</i> .....	703
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Mpambara</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-65-T, T. Ch. I, 11 September 2006. ..	713
Separate Opinion of Judge Lattanzi, 17 September 2006.....	775
Commentary <i>Edith Weemaels and Joanna Spanoudis</i> .....	780
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2000-55A-T, T. Ch. II, 12 September 2006. ....	789
Commentary <i>Menno Dolman</i> .....	925
 <b>Part 4/ Post conviction or acquittal issues</b>	
 <b>10. Sentencing</b>	
Decision on Hassan Ngeze's Motion Requesting to Rectify the <b>Differential and Unequal Treatment</b> between the ICTR and ICTY in Sentencing Policies and Other Rights, <i>Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 23 February 2006. ....	935
Commentary <i>Jens David Ohlin</i> .....	938
 <b>11. Early release/ enforcement of sentences</b>	
Decision on Request for Early Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Rutaganira</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-IC-T, Pres., 2 June 2006. ....	947
Decision on Motion for Partial Enforcement of Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Serugendo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2005-84-1, T. Ch. I, 22 June 2006. ....	951
Commentary <i>Wendy de Bondt and Els de Busser</i> .....	954
 <b>12. Review</b>	
Decision on Request for Review, <i>Niyitegeka v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-R, A. Ch., 30 June 2006. ....	957
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen .....	976
Commentary <i>Heikelina Verrijn Stuart</i> .....	985
<b>Index</b> .....	<b>995</b>
<b>Contributors and Editors</b> .....	<b>999</b>