



V O L U M E

# **Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals**

**The International  
Criminal Court 2005-2007**

**André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)**



intersentia

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents . . . . .	5
Preface . . . . .	11
<b>Part 1/ Preliminary Matters</b>	
<b>1. Unique Investigative Opportunity/ Preservation of Evidence/ Initiation of Investigations</b>	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Request for Measures Under Article 56, <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04, P-T. Ch. I, 26 April 2005 . . . . .	13
Decision Following the Consultation Held on 11 October 2005 and the Prosecution's Submission on Jurisdiction and Admissibility Filed on 31 October 2005, <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04, P-T. Ch. I, 9 November 2005 . . . . .	17
Decision Requesting Information on the Status of the Preliminary Examination of the Situation in the Central African Republic, <i>Situation in the Central African Republic</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05, P-T. Ch. III, 30 November 2006 . . . . .	21
Commentary <i>Cécile Aptel</i> . . . . .	24
<b>2, Arrest Warrants and Admissibility</b>	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Application for Warrants of Arrest Under Article 58, <i>Situation in Uganda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/04, P-T. Ch. II, 8 July 2005. . . . .	31
Warrant of Arrest for Joseph Kony Issued on 8 July 2005 as Amended on 27 September 2005, <i>Prosecutor v. Kony</i> , Case No. ICC-02/04-01/05, P-T. Ch. II, 27 September 2005. . . . .	37
Warrant of Arrest, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 10 February 2006 ..	49
Decision on the Prosecutor's Application for Warrants of Arrest, Article 58, <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, P-T. Ch. I, 10 February 2006 . . . . .	53
Judgement on the Prosecutor's Appeal Against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber 1 Entitled "Decision on the Prosecutor's Application for Warrants of Arrest, Article 58", <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04, A. Ch., 13 July 2006 . . . . .	85
Separate and Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Georghios M. Pikis. . . . .	101
Commentary <i>Dov Jacobs</i> . . . . .	113
<b>Part 2/ Procedural Matters</b>	
<b>3. Habeas Corpus Rights</b>	
Decision on the Defence Challenge to the Jurisdiction of the Court Pursuant to Article 19(2)(a) of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 3 October 2006. . . . .	123
Decision on the Application for the Interim Release of Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 18 October 2006. . . . .	129

## Table of Contents

Judgment on the Appeal of Mr. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo Against the Decision on the Defence Challenge to the Jurisdiction of the Court Pursuant to Article 19(2)(a) of the Statute of 3 October 2006, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 (OA4), A. Ch. 14 December 2006. . . . . 133

Judgment on the Appeal of Mr. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo Against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I Entitled "Decision sur la demande de mise en liberté provisoire de Thomas Lubanga Dyilo", *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 (OA7), A. Ch. 13 February 2007. . . . . 147

Separate Opinion of Judge Georghios M. Pikis. . . . . 175

Dissenting Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song Regarding the Participation of Victims.....180

Commentary *Amir Cengic*. . . . . 182

### 4. Participation of Victims

Decision on the Applications for Participation in the Proceedings of VPRS 1, VPRS 2, VPRS 3, VPRS 4, VPRS 5 and VPRS 6, *Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo*, Case No. ICC-01/04,P-T. Ch. 1, 17 January 2006. . . . . 193

Decision on the Applications for Participation in the Proceedings Submitted by VPRS 1 to VPRS 6 in the Case the Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 29 June 2006. . . . . 221

Decision on the Applications for Participation in the Proceedings of a/0001/06, a/0002/06 and a/0003/06 in the Case of the Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo and of the Investigation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 28 July 2006. . . . . 227

Decision on the Arrangements for Participation of Victims a/0001/06, a/0002/06 and a/0003/06 at the Confirmation Hearing, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 22 September 2006. . . . . 235

Decision on Applications for Participation in Proceedings a/0004/06 to a/0009/06, a/0016/06, a/0063/06, a/0071/06 to a/0080/06 and a/0105/06 in the Case of the Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 20 October 2006. . . . . 241

Order of the Appeals Chamber, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, A. Ch., 4 December 2006. . . . . 249

Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pikis to the Order of the Appeals Chamber Issued on 4 December 2006, 11 December 2006. . . . . 251

Decision of the Appeals Chamber on the Joint Application of Victims a/0001/06 to a/0003/06 and a/0105/06 Concerning the "Directions and Decision of the Appeals Chamber" of 2 February 2007, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*. Case No. ICC-01/04 (A08), A. Ch., 13 June 2007. . . . . 255

Separate Opinion of Judge Georghios M. Pikis. . . . . 261

Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song. . . . . 268

Commentary *Marc Groenhuijsen and Anne-Marie de Brouwer*.....273

### 5. Witnesses - Decisions **Related to Protection**

Decision on the "Prosecutors Application to Disclose to Internal Auditor certain Information Relating to the Amended Application for Warrants" Dated 13 June 2005, *Situation in Uganda*, Case No. ICC-02/04, P-T Ch. II, 17 June 2005. . . . . 281

Decision Concerning Pre-Trial Chamber I's Decision of 10 February 2006 and the Incorporation of Documents Into the Record of the Case of Mr. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 24 February 2006 [Annex omitted]. . . . .	285
Decision Inviting Observations in Application of Rule 103 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Situation in Darfur, Sudan</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05, P-T. Ch. I, 24 July 2006. . . . .	289
Decision on a General Framework Concerning Protective Measures for Prosecution and Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 19 September 2006. . . . .	293
Commentary <i>hiakan Friman</i> . . . . .	297
<b>6. Witness Proofing</b>	
Decision on the Practices of Witness Familiarisation and Witness Proofing, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 8 November 2006. . . . .	303
Commentary <i>Sergey Vasiliev</i> . . . . .	313
<b>7. Disclosure</b>	
Decision on the Final System of Disclosure and the Establishment of a Timetable, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 15 May 2006. . . . .	327
Decision on the Defence Request for Unrestricted Access to the Entire File of the Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 17 May 2006. . . . .	353
Commentary <i>Yannis Naziris</i> . . . . .	356
<b>8. Disclosure - Interpretation of Rule 81</b>	
Decision Establishing General Principles Governing Applications to Restrict Disclosure Pursuant to Rule 81(2) and (4) of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 19 May 2006. . . . .	367
Decision on the Prosecution Request for Access to the Registry Recommendations, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 31 July 2006. . . . .	377
First Decision on the Prosecution Requests and Amended Requests for Redactions Under Rule 81, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 15 September 2006. . . . .	381
Judgment on the Prosecutor's Appeal Against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I Entitled "Decision Establishing General Principles Governing Applications to Restrict Disclosure pursuant to Rule 81(2) and (4) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence", <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, A. Ch., 13 October 2006. . . . .	387
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Georghios M. Pikis. . . . .	404
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo Against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I Entitled "First Decision on the Prosecution Requests and Amended Requests for Redactions under Rule 81", <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 (OA5), A. Ch., 14 December 2006. . . . .	413
Separate Opinion of Judge Georghios M. Pikis. . . . .	425

Judgment on the Appeal of Mr. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo Against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I Entitled "Second Decision on the Prosecution Requests and Amended Requests for Redactions under Rule 81", <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 (A06), A. Ch., 14 December 2006	427
Separate Opinion by Judge Georghios M. Pikis	441
Commentary <i>Salvatore Zappalá</i>	444

## 9. Admissibility of Evidence

Decision Concerning the Prosecutor Proposed Summary Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. 1, 4 October 2006	451
Commentary <i>Erik Kok and Lela Scott</i>	457

## 10. Preparation of Defence/ Language Issues

Decision on the Requests of the Defence of 3 and 4 July 2006, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. 1, 4 August 2006	463
Decision on the Defence "Request to Exclude Video Evidence Which has not Been Disclosed in one of the Working Languages", <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 7 November 2006	467
Commentary <i>Karel de Meester</i>	470

## 11. Impartiality/ Conflict of Interests

Decision on the Prosecutor's Application to Separate the Senior Legal Adviser to the Pre-Trial Division From Rendering Legal Advice Regarding the Case, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 27 October 2006	479
Commentary <i>Juénaél Mettraux</i>	489

## 12. Counsel

Decision du Greffier sur la demande d'aide judiciaire aux frais de la Cour déposée par la victime a/0105/06. <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 3 November 2006	493
Decision on the <i>ad hoc</i> Counsel for Defence Request of 18 December 2006, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 2 February 2007	497
Reasons for "Decision of the Appeals Chamber on the Defence Application 'Demande de suspension de toute action ou procedure afin de permettre la designation d*un nouveau Conseil de la Defense' Filed on 20 February 2007" Issued on 23 February 2007, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 (OA8), A. Ch., 9 March 2007	501
Decision on the Request for Review of the Registry's Decision of 13 February 2007, <i>Situation in Darfur, Sudan</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05, P-T. Ch. I, 15 March 2007	509
Registrar's Observations in Accordance With Rule 20(1)(d) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence on the Document Entitled "Clarification", Filed With the Presidency of the Court on 3 April 2007 by Mr Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 5 April 2007	513

Appointment of Duty Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 19 April 2007. . . . .	521
Decision of the Appeals Chamber Upon the Registrar's Requests of 5 April 2007, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06 (OA8), A. Ch., 27 April 2007. . . . .	525
Commentary <i>Alexander Zahar</i> . . . . .	529
 13. State Cooperation	
Request to the Democratic Republic of the Congo for the Purpose of Obtaining the Identification, Tracing, Freezing and Seizure of Property and Assets Belonging to Mr Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 9 March 2006. . . . .	531
Request to the States Parties to the Rome Statute for the Identification, Tracing, Freezing and Seizure of the Property and Assets of Mr Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 31 March 2006. . . . .	535
Commentary <i>Annalisa Ciampi</i> . . . . .	538
 <b>14. Rights/ Legal Position of Detainees</b>	
Registrar's Decision Pursuant to Regulation 196(1) of the Regulations of the Registry, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, Registrar, 17 March 2006. . . . .	545
Commentary <i>Denis Abels</i> . . . . .	517
 <b>15. Appeal, Review and Other Remedies</b>	
Decision on Prosecutor's Application for Leave to Appeal in Part Pre-Trial Chamber II's Decision on the Prosecutor's Applications for Warrants of Arrest Under Article 58, <i>Situation in Uganda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/04-01/05, P-T. Ch. II, 19 August 2005. . . . .	557
Decision on the Prosecutor's Position on the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber II to Redact Factual Descriptions of Crimes From Warrants of Arrest, Motion for Reconsideration and Motion for Clarification, <i>Situation in Uganda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/04-01/05, P-T. Ch. II, 28 October 2005. . . . .	571
Decision on the Prosecution's Application for Leave to Appeal the Chamber's Decision of 17 January 2006 on the Applications for Participation in the Proceedings of VPRS 1, VPRS 2, VPRS 3, VPRS 4, VPRS 5 and VPRS 6, <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04, 31 March 2006. . . . .	577
Decision on the Appellant's Application for an Extension of the Time Limit for the Filing of the Document in Support of the Appeal and Order Pursuant to Regulation 28 of the Regulations of the Court, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, A. Ch., 30 May 2006. . . . .	589
Separate Opinion by Judge Oeorghios M. Pikis. . . . .	593
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Reconsideration and, in the Alternative, Leave to Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 23 June 2006. . . . .	595
Judgment on the Prosecutor's Application for Extraordinary Review of Pre-Trial Chamber I's 31 March 2006 Decision Denying Leave to Appeal, <i>Situation in the Democratic Republic of the Congo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04, A. Ch., 13 July 2006. . . . .	607
Decision on the Prosecution Amended Application Pursuant to Rule 81(2), <i>Prosecutor v. Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 2 August 2006. . . . .	617

*Table of Contents*

Decision on Defence Motion for Leave to Appeal, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 18 August 2006 . . . . . 623

Decision on Thomas Lubanga Dyilo's Application for Referral to the Pre-Trial Chamber / In the Alternative, Discontinuance of Appeal, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, A, Ch., 6 September 2006 . . . . . 629

Decision on Second Defence Motion for Leave to Appeal, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 28 September 2006 . . . . . 633

Commentary *Astrid Reisinger Coracini*. . . . . 640

**Part 3 / Judgements**

**16. Confirmation of Charges**

Decision on the Confirmation of Charges, *Prosecutor v. Dyilo*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, P-T. Ch. I, 29 January 2007. . . . . 655

Commentary *Ka'i Ambos*. . . . . 736

**Index** . . . . . 749

**Contributors and Editors**. . . . . 753