



Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

V O L U M E

**The International
Criminal Tribunal
for Rwanda 2003**

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)



intersentia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	11
Part 1 / Preliminary matters	
1. Provisional Release	
Decision on the Defence Motion on a Point of Law (Rule 73), <i>Prosecutor v. Bicamumpaka</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-I, T. Ch. II, 8 April 2003.	13
Decision on the Motion by Ngirumpatse's Defence to Find the Accused's Detention Unlawful or, in the Alternative, to Order his Provisional Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Ngirumpatse et ah</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T.Ch. m, 18 August 2003.	19
Commentary <i>Rick Lawson</i>	25
2. Indictment	
Decision on Preliminary Motion, <i>Prosecutor v. Rukundo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-70-1, T. Ch. HI, 26 February 2003.	31
Separate Declaration of Pavel Dolenc Regarding Decision on Preliminary Motion, 4 March 2003.	37
Commentary <i>Pedro Caeiro</i>	41
Decision on the Prosecutor's Request for Leave to File an Amended Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-I, T. Ch. II, 6 October 2003.	53
Decision on Prosecutor's Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment and on Defence Urgent Motion for an Order to Disclose Supporting Material in Respect of the Prosecutor's Motion for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-1, T.Ch. HI, 15 October 2003.	61
Commentary <i>Pedro Caeiro</i>	68
Part 2 / Procedural Matters	
3. Joinder and Separation of Trials	
Decision on Motions by Ntabakuze for Severance and to Establish a Reasonable Schedule for the Presentation of Prosecution Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsenyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 9 September 2003.	73
Decision (Appeal of the Trial Chamber I "Decision on motions by Ntabakuze for Severance and to Establish a Reasonable Schedule for the Presentation of Prosecution Witness" of 9 September 2003), <i>Ntabakuze v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR72(C), A. Ch., 28 October 2003.	83
Commentary <i>Enrique Carnero Rojo</i>	87

4. Continuation of Proceedings and Expeditious Trial

Decision on the Prosecutor's Extremely Urgent Request for a Suspension of Time Limits and for an Extension of Time for Filing an Application for Rebuttal, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntagerura, Bagambiki and Imanishimwe</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-46-T, T. Ch. HI, 10 April 2003.	91
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Yakov Ostrovsky.	95
Decision on Continuation or Commencement <i>de novo</i> of Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 11 June 2003.	99
Decision on the Matter of Proceedings Under Rule <u>5bis</u> (D), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-21-T), <i>Nsabimana and Nteziryayo</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-29A&B-T), <i>Kanyabashi</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-15-T), and <i>Ndayambaje</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-8-T), Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 15 July 2003.	105
Decision in the Matter of Proceedings under Rule <u>5bis</u> (D), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-21-T), <i>Nsabimana and Nteziryayo</i> (Case No. ICTR-97-29A&B-T), <i>Kanyabashi</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-15-T), and <i>Ndayambaje</i> (Case No. ICTR-96-8-T), Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-A15Ws, A. Ch., 24 September 2003.	121
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen.	132
Dissenting Opinion of Judge David Hunt.	134
Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza's Motion to Dismiss the Indictment for Violation of Article 20 (4) (c) of the Statute, Demand for Speedy Trial and for Appropriate Relief, <i>Prosecutor v. Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-I, T. Ch. II, 2 October 2003.	145
Decision on Extremely Urgent Prosecution Application for an Adjournment of the Oral Hearing, <i>Elizaphan Ntakirutimana and Gerard Ntakirutimana v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-10-A and ICTR-96-17-A, A. Ch., 20 November 2003.	149
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Schomburg.	153
Commentary <i>Hcikan Priman</i>	155
5. Disclosure and Other Access to Materials and Evidence	
Decision on the Motions of the Parties Concerning the Inspection and Disclosure of a Videotape, <i>Prosecutor v. Kajelijeli</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44A-T, T. Ch. H, 28 April 2003.	163
Decision on Defence Motion for Reconsideration of the Trial Chamber's Decision and Scheduling Order of 5 December 2001, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 18 July 2003.	169
Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza's Motion to Require the Registrar to Allow Access to a Witness, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR- 99-50-1, T. Ch. II, 2 October 2003.	175
Decision on the Defence Motion for Disclosure of Exculpatory Evidence (Rule 68 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Nzirorera et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T. Ch. HI, 7 October 2003.	183
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Motion for Disclosure of Closed Session Testimony and Exhibits Received Under Seal, <i>Prosecutor v. Kajelijeli</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-44A-T, T. Ch. H, 7 October 2003.	189

Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Second Motion for Disclosure of Closed Session Testimony and Exhibits Received under Seal, <i>Prosecutor v. Kajelijeli</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-44A-T, T. Ch. H, 29 October 2003.	195
Commentary <i>Christopher Rassi</i>	198
6. Witnesses	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Depositions of Ngeze Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-T, T.Ch. I, 7 March 2003.	207
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Leave to Call Rebuttal Evidence (Rule 85), <i>Prosecutor v. Kajelijeli</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44A-T, T. Ch. II, 12 May 2003.	211
Decision of 9 May 2003 on the Prosecutor's Application for Rebuttal Witnesses as Corrected According to the Order of 13 May 2003, <i>Prosecutor v. Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-T, T.Ch. I, 13 May 2003.	217
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Protective Measures for Victims and Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Gacumbitsi</i> Case No. ICTR-2001-64-1, T. Ch. HI, 20 May 2003.	231
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Leave to Call Evidence in Rebuttal Pursuant to Rules 54, 73 and 85 (A) (iii) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntagerura, Bagambiki and Imanishimwe</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-46-T, T. Ch. HI, 21 May 2003.	237
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Addition of Witnesses Pursuant to Rule 12>bis (E), <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T.Ch. I, 26 June 2003.	249
Decision on the Defence Motion for Subpoena to Witness G, <i>Prosecutor v. Nzirorera et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T.Ch. ffl, 20 October 2003.	257
Commentary <i>Gerhard Kemp</i>	262
7. Admissibility of Evidence and Judicial Notice	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion to Remove From her Witness List Five Deceased Witnesses and to Admit Into Evidence the Witness Statements of Four of Said Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndayambaje, Kanyabashi, Nyiratnasuhuko, Ntahobali, Nsabimana and Nteziryayo</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 22 January 2003.	269
Decision on Kamuhanda's Motion to Admit Evidence Pursuant to Rule 89 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence. <i>Prosecutor v. Kamuhanda</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-54A-T, T. Ch. II, 10 February 2003_____	277
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Judicial Notice pursuant to Rules 73, 89 and 94, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. ffl, 11 April 2003.	283
Decision on Admissibility of Proposed Testimony of Witnesses DBY, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 18 September 2003.	299
Commentary <i>Steven Freeland</i>	309

8. Contempt, Counsel and Right to an Effective Defence

The President's Decision on Ferdinand Nahimana's Appeal Against the Disciplinary Measures Imposed on him by the UNDF, *Prosecutor v. Nahimana*, Case No. ICTR-96-11-T, Pres., 10 February 2003. 317

The President's Decision on an Application by Pauline Nyiramasuhuko for Review of the Registrar's Decision Declining the Reappointment of her two Investigators, *Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali*, Case No. ICTR- 97-21-T, Pres., 9 April 2003. 321

Decision on the Defence Request for Leave to Interview Potential Prosecution Witnesses Jean Mr. Kambanda, Georges Ruggiu and Omar Serushago, *Prosecutor v. Joseph Nzirorera et al.*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T. Ch. HI, 29 September 2003. 327

Decision on Defence Request for an Investigation Into Alleged False Testimony of Witness DO, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 3 October 2003. 331

Decision on Defence Third Motion for Return of Property and Sanctions for Violation of Court Order, *Prosecutor v. Nzirorera et al.*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T. Ch. m, 13 October 2003. 337

Decision on the Accused's Request to Instruct the Registrar to Replace Assigned Lead Counsel (Article 20 (4) (d) of the Statute and Rules 45 and 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), *Prosecutor v. Muvunyi et al*, Case No. ICTR-2000-55-I, T.Ch. HI, 18 November 2003. 343

Order to Duty Counsel Regarding the Deposition of Prosecution Witness QX (Rule 54 of the Rules of procedure and evidence), *Prosecutor v. Muvunyi, Nizeyimana and Hategekimana*, Case No. ICTR-2000-55-1, T.Ch. HI, 28 November 2003. 347

Commentary *Karin Bruinenberg*. 349

9. State Cooperation and Enforcement of Sentences

The President's Decision on the Prosecutor's *Ex Parte* Application for the Continued Detention of Georges Ruggiu in the Tribunal's Detention Facility in Arusha, *Prosecutor v. Ruggiu*, Pres., 17 January 2003. 359

Decision on the Motion to Stay the Proceedings in the Trial of Ferdinand Nahimana, *Prosecutor v. Nahimana, Ngeze and Barayagwiza*, ICTR-99-52-T, T. Ch. I, 5 June 2003. 363

Decision on the Defence Motion to Order the Government of Rwanda to Show Cause, *Prosecutor v. Nzirorera et al.* Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T. Ch. m, 4 September 2003. 371

Decision on the Request to the Governments of United States of America, Belgium, France and Germany for Cooperation, *Prosecutor v. Nzirorera et al*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-I, T. Ch. III, 4 September 2003. 375

Commentary *Cecilia Nils son-Kleffner*. 377

Part 3 / Judgement and Sentencing

10. Judgements

Judgement and Sentence, *Prosecutor v. Elizaphan Ntakirutimana and Gerard Ntakirutimana*, Cases No. ICTR-96-10 and ICTR-96-17-T, T. Ch. I, 21 February 2003. 383

Commentary <i>Gentian Zyberi</i>	581
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Semanza</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-20-T, T. Ch. HI, 15 May 2003 . .	599
Separate Opinion of Judge Yakov Ostrovsky Concerning Serious Violations of Article 3 Common to the Geneva Conventions and Additional Protocol II	697
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pavel Dolenc.	707
Commentary <i>William A. Schabas</i>	724
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Niyitegeka</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-14-T, T. Ch. I, 16 May 2003 . .	731
Commentary <i>Goran Sluiter</i>	851
Judgement, <i>Rutaganda v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-3-A, A. Ch., 26 May 2003.	857
Separate Opinion of Judges Meron and Jorda	1002
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar.	1003
Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen.	1007
Commentary <i>Larissa van den Herik</i>	1020
Index	1031
Contributors and Editors	1035