



V O L U M E

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

**The International
Criminal Tribunal
for Rwanda 2001-2002**

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)



intersentia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface from the editors	11
 Part 1 / Preliminary matters	
1. Jurisdiction	
Decision (Appeal Against the Decision of 13 March 2001 Dismissing “Defence Motion Objecting to the Jurisdiction of the Tribunal”), <i>Kajelijeli v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44A-T, A. Ch., 16 November 2001	15
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen	19
Separate Opinion of Judge Pocar	21
Commentary <i>Gentian Zyberi</i>	23
 2. Form of the indictment	
Decision on the Ex-Parte Application of the Prosecutor for Leave to Amend the Indictment Pursuant to Rule 50 and Review and Confirmation of Amended Indictment and Related Documents, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndindabahizi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-71-I, Judge Dolenc, 3 October 2001	27
Decision on Sagahutu’s Preliminary Provisional Release and Severance Motions, <i>Prosecutor v. Sagahutu et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-56-T, T. Ch. II, 25 September 2002	33
Commentary <i>Roelof Haveman</i>	43
 Part 2 / Procedural matters	
3. Joinder, elements of the right to a fair trial and rights of detained persons	
Decision on the Defence Motion to Suppress Custodial Statements by the Accused (Rules 73, 47(H) ii), 63, and 92 of the Rules; Article 20 of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 8 June 2001	47
Decision on the Motion for Separate Trials (Rules 48, 72(B) iii) and 82(B) of the Rules), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 8 June 2001 ...	51
Decision on the Defence Motion for the Translation of Prosecution and Procedural Documents into Kinyarwanda, the Language of the Accused, and into French, the Language of his Counsel. Articles 20 and 31 of the Statute and Rules 3, 19, 31, 33 (B), 54, 66 (A) et 73 of the Rules, <i>Prosecutor v. Muhimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1-B-1, T. Ch. I, 6 November 2001	59
Decision (Motion by Aloys Ntabakuze’s Defence for Execution of the Trial Chamber’s Decision of 23 May 2002 on the Prosecutor’s Pre-Trial Brief, dated 21 January 2002, and Another Motion on a Related Matter), <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. III, 4 November 2002	67
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Dolenc, 5 November 2002	73
	5

7. Disclosure

Decision on the Defence Motions for Disclosure of Copies of the Prosecutor's Exhibit (Rules 66B and 73 of the Rules), *Prosecutor v. Nsabimana and Nteziryayo*, Case No. ICTR-97-29-T, T. Ch. II, 18 September 2001 247

Commentary *James Cockyane* 253

8. Contempt of court

Decision on Prosecution Motion for Contempt of Court and on two Defence Motions for Disclosure etc., *Prosecutor v. Ntakirutimana and Ntakirutimana*, Case No. ICTR-96-10-I, ICTR-96-17-T, T. Ch. I, 16 July 2001 257

Decision on the Prosecutor's further Allegations of Contempt, *Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko, Ntahobali* (Case No. ICTR-97-21-T), *Nsabimana, Nteziryayo* (Case No. ICTR-97-29-T), *Kanyabashi* (Case No. ICTR-96-15-T) and *Ndayambaje* (Case No. ICTR-96-8-T), T. Ch. II, 30 November 2001 263

Decision on the Prosecution Motion *ex parte* in the Matter of Violation of the Trial Chamber's Witness Protection Orders, and Contempt of Court, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. III, 5 July 2002 273

Commentary *Shahram Dana* 278

9. Res judicata

Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Judicial Notice of Adjudicated Facts (Rule 94(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), *Prosecutor v. Ntakirutimana and Ntakirutimana*, ICTR-96-10-I and ICTR-96-17-T, T. Ch. I, 22 November 2001 285

Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Judicial Notice Pursuant to Rule 94 of the Rules, *Prosecutor v. Kajelijeli*, Case No. ICTR-98-44A-T, T. Ch. II, 16 April 2002 295

Commentary *Gerhard Kemp* 301

Part 3 / Judgements

10. Decisions on Motion for Judgement of Acquittal

Decision on the Defence Motion for a Judgement of Acquittal in Respect of Laurent Semanza after Quashing the Counts Contained in the Third Amended Indictment (Article 98bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence) and Decision on the Prosecutor's Urgent Motion for Suspension of Time-Limit for Response to the Defence Motion for a Judgement of Acquittal, *Prosecutor v. Semanza*, Case No. ICTR-97-20-T, T. Ch. III, 27 September 2001 307

Commentary *Larissa van den Herik* 312

Oral Majority Decision on Imanishimwe's Defence Motion for Judgement of Acquittal on Court of Conspiracy to Commit Genocide Pursuant to Rule 98bis, *Prosecutor v. Ntagerura, Bagambih, Imanishimwe*, Case No. ICTR-99-46-T, T. Ch. III, Transcript of 6 March 2002 317

Decision on the Motion of Tharcisse Muvunyi for Leave to Make Submissions as Amicus Curiae in the Butare Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi, Ndayambaje, Nsabimana, Nteziryayo, Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 8 June 2001	161
The President's Decision on the Application by Arsène Shalom Ntahobali for Review of the Registrar's Decisions Pertaining to the Assignment of an Investigator, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Pres., 13 November 2002	165
Decision on the Defence Motion for Access for Investigators and Assistants to the Accused in the Absence of Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 20 November 2002	169
Commentary <i>Chris de Roy</i>	173
6. Witnesses and evidence	
Decision on the Defence Motion for Protection of Witnesses (Rule 75), <i>Prosecutor v. Semanza</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-20-T, T. Ch. III, 24 May 2001	177
Decision on the Prosecutor's Allegations of Contempt, the Harmonisation of the Witness Protection Measures and Warning to the Prosecutor's Counsel (Rules 46, 54, 73 and 77 of the Rules and Article 9 (3) (c) (ii) of the Code of Professional Conduct for Defence Counsel), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, <i>Prosecutor v. Nsabimana and Nteziryayo</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-29-T, <i>Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-15-T, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndayambaje</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-8-T, T. Ch. II, 10 July 2001	181
Decision on the Prosecutor's Application to Add Witness X to its List of Witnesses and for Protective Measures, <i>Prosecutor v. Nahimana, Ngeze and Barayagwiza</i> , ICTR-99-52-I, T. Ch. I, 14 September 2001	191
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Asoka de Z. Gunawardana	199
Decision on a Defence Application to Admit into Evidence a Report of Prosecution Investigator P.J.J. Heuts, <i>Prosecutor v. Semanza</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-20-T, T. Ch. III, 9 November 2001	205
Separate Dissenting Opinion of Judge Williams	208
Decision and Scheduling Order on the Prosecution Motion for Harmonisation and Modification of Protective Measures for Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Nsengiyumva, Kabiligi and Ntabakuze</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-I, T. Ch. III, 5 December 2001	213
Separate Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pavel Dolenc	221
Decision («Prosecution's Urgent Request for Clarification in relation to the Applicability of Rule 66(B) to Appellate Proceedings and Request for Extension of the Page Limit applicable to Motions»), <i>Rutaganda v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-3-A, A. Ch., 28 June 2002	227
Declaration of President Jorda and Judge Shahabuddeen	230
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Protective Measures for Victims and Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Rukundo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-70-I, T. Ch. III, 24 October 2002	233
Commentary <i>Roy Schondorf</i>	239

Decision on the Defence Motion to Protect the Applicant's Right to Full Answer and Defence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-I, T. Ch. II, 15 November 2002	77
The President's Decision on a Defence Motion to Reverse the Prosecutor's Request for Prohibition of Contact Pursuant to Rule 64, <i>Prosecutor v. Nindiliyimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-2000-56-T, Pres., 25 November 2002	83
Commentary <i>Taru Spronken</i>	87
 4. Provisional release and habeas corpus-matters	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Request pursuant to Rule 99 (B), <i>Prosecutor v. Bagilishema</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1A-T, T. Ch. I, 8 June 2001	95
Decision on the Prosecutor's Urgent Motion for Suspension of the Time Limit for Response in the Matter of Defence Motion "Requête en demande de mise en liberté" filed by Counsel for Bagosora on 8 April 2002, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-I, T. Ch. III, 19 April 2002	99
Separate Concurring Opinion of Judge Dolenc	101
Decision on Musabyimana's Motion on the Violation of Rule 55 and International Law at the Time of his Arrest and Transfer, <i>Prosecutor v. Musabyimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-62-T, T. Ch. II, 20 June 2002	103
Decision on the Defence Motion for Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. III, 12 July 2002	109
Decision on the Defence's Motion for the Release or Alternatively Provisional Release of Ferdinand Nahimana (Rule 65 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Nahimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-52-T, T. Ch. I, 5 September 2002	115
Commentary <i>Håkan Friman</i>	119
 5. Right to counsel, effective defence and amicus curiae	
Decision on Ntahobali's Motion for Withdrawal of Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 22 June 2001	125
Decision on Nzirorera's Motion for Withdrawal of Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. II, 3 October 2001	131
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge W.C. Matanzima Maqutu on the Request of the Accused for Change of Assigned Counsel	139
Commentary <i>Jarinde Temmick Tuinstra</i>	145
Decision on the Application to File an Amicus Curiae Brief According to Rule 74 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence filed on Behalf of the NGO Coalition for Women's Human Rights in Conflict Situations, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntagerura, Bagambiki and Imanishimwe</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-46-T, T. Ch. III, 24 May 2001	153
Separate Opinion of Judge Yakov Ostrovsky	159

Separate and Concurring Decision of Judge Williams on Imanishimwe's Defence Motion for Judgement of Acquittal on Count of Conspiracy to Commit genocide Pursuant to Rule 98bis, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntagerura, Bagambih, Imanishimwe</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-46-T, T. Ch. III, 13 March 2002	321
Decision on Kamuhanda's Motion for Partial Acquittal pursuant to Rule 98bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Kamuhanda</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-54A-T, T. Ch. II, 20 August 2002	325
Commentary <i>Jann Kleffner</i>	330
 11. Judgements	
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Akayesu</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-4-A, A. Ch., 1 June 2001	335
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen	475
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Nieto-Navia	478
Commentary <i>Emanuela Fronza</i>	481
Judgment (Reasons), <i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema and Ruzindana</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1-A, A. Ch., 1 June 2001	495
Declaration of Judge Nieto-Navia	578
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen	580
Commentary <i>Joachim Renzikowski</i>	600
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagilishema</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1A-T, T. Ch. I, 7 June 2001	617
Separate Opinion of Judge Asoka de Z. Gunawardana	791
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Mehmet Güney	817
Commentary <i>André Klip</i>	859
Judgment, <i>Musema v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-13-A, A. Ch., 16 November 2001	863
Declaration of Judge Shahabuddeen	957
Commentary <i>Göran Sluiter</i>	968
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagilishema</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1A-A, A. Ch., 3 July 2002	977
Judgment (Reasons), <i>Prosecutor v. Bagilishema</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1A-A, A. Ch., 13 December 2002	979
Commentary <i>Paola Gaeta</i>	1021
Index	1027
Contributors and Editors	1031