



Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

**The International
Criminal Tribunal
for Rwanda 1994-1999**

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	9
Part 1 Preliminary Matters	
1. Jurisdiction	
Decision on the Defence Motion on Jurisdiction, <i>Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-15-T, T. Ch. 2, 18 June 1997.	13
Commentary <i>Clans Krefi</i>	23
2. Form of the Indictment	
Decision on the Defence Motion for the Amendment of Indictment, Withdrawal of Certain Charges and Protective Measures for Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Nsabimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-29A-T, T. Ch. II, 24 September 1998.	27
Decision on the Prosecutor's Urgent Motion for Stay of Execution of Decision of 24 September 1998 & Decision on Nsabimana's Motion for Withdrawal of the Indictment and Immediate Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Nsabimana and Nteziryayo</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-29-I, T. Ch. II, 21 May 1999.	33
Decision on the Defence Motion on Defects in the Form of the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagambiki, Imanishimwe and Munyakazi</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-36-(I), T. Ch. n, 24 September 1998.	39
Separate Opinion of Judge Sekule on the Decision of the Defence Motion on Defects in the Form of the Indictment	43
Decision on Defence Preliminary Motion on Defects in the Form of the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruggiu</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-32-T, T. Ch. I, 24 May 1999.	45
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Kabiligi and Ntabakuze</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-34-I and Case No. ICTR-97-30-I, T. Ch. II, 8 October 1999.	51
Separate and Concurring Opinion of Judge Dolenc.	61
Commentary <i>John O'Dowd</i>	74
Part 2 Relations to National Jurisdictions	
3. Deferral	
Decision on the Formal Request for Deferral Presented by the Prosecutor, <i>Prosecutor v. Musema</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-5-D, T. Ch. I, 12 March 1996.	81
Decision on the Formal Request for Deferral Presented by the Prosecutor, <i>Prosecutor v. Radio Television Libre des Mille Collines SARL</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-6-D, T. Ch. I, 12 March 1996.	87
Decision on the Application by the Prosecutor for a Formal Request for Deferral, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-7-D, T. Ch. I, 17 May 1996.	93
Commentary <i>Tom I underBeken</i>	99

4. Decisions Relating to the Release of Ntuyahaga

Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion to Withdraw the Indictment, *Prosecutor v. Ntuyahaga*, Case No. ICTR-98-40-T, T. Ch. I, 18 March 1999. 103

Decision by the Registrar in Execution of the Decision by Trial Chamber I Ordering the Release of Mr. Bernard Ntuyahaga. 29 March 1999. 109

Declaration on a Point of Law by Judge Laity Kama, President of the Tribunal, Judge Lennart Aspegren and Judge Navanethem Pillay, 22 April 1999. 113

Commentary *Goran Stutter*. 118

Part 3 Procedural Matters

5. Arrest and Transfer to the Custody of the Tribunal

Decision on the Extremely Urgent Motion by the Defence for Orders to Review and/or Nullify the Arrest and Provisional Detention of the Suspect, *Prosecutor v. Barayagwiza*, Case No. ICTR-97-19-1, T. Ch. II, 24 November 1998. 123

Decision. *Barayagwiza v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-97-19-AR72, A. Ch., 3 November 1999 ... 129

Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen. 175

Declaration of Judge Nieto-Navia 191

Decision on the "Motion to Set Aside the Arrest and Detention of Laurent Semanza as Unlawful", *Prosecutor v. Semanza*, Case No. ICTR-97-20-I, T. Ch. m, 6 October 1999. 193

Commentary *Bert Swart*. 197

6. Witnesses

Decision on the Motion for the Protection of Defence Witnesses, *Prosecutor v. Kayishema and Ruzindana*, Case No. ICTR-95-1-T, T. Ch. 2, 6 October 1997. 209

Decision on the Motion to Subpoena a Witness, *Prosecutor v. Akayesu*, Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, T. Ch. I, 19 November 1997. 215

Decision on the Protective Measures for Defence Witnesses and Their Families, *Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi*, Case No. ICTR-96-15-T, T. Ch. 2, 25 November 1997. 219

Decision on a Motion for Summonses and Protection of Witnesses Called by the Defence, *Prosecutor v. Akayesu*, Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, T. Ch. I, 17 February 1998. 225

Decision on the Urgent Motion Filed by the Defence for the Immediate Transfer and Appearance of a Detained Witness. Froduald Karamira, *Prosecutor v. Rutaganda*, Case No. ICTR-96-3-T, T. Ch. I, 26 March 1998. 229

Decision on Appeals against the Decision by Trial Chamber I rejecting the Defence Motions to Direct the Prosecutor to Investigate the Matter of False Testimony by Witnesses "E" and "CC", *Prosecutor v. Rutaganda*, Case No. ICTR-96-3-A, A. Ch. 8 June 1998. 233

Declaration of Judge Mohamed Shahabuddeen on the Admissibility of Appeals against the Decisions by Trial Chamber I Rejecting the Defence Motions to Direct the Prosecutor to Investigate the Matters of False Testimony by Witnesses "E" and "CC". 241

Decision on the Defence Motion for the Protection of Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntagerura</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-10A-I. T. Ch. II, 24 August 1998	243
Commentary <i>Michael Scharf</i>	249
7. Disclosure	
Decision on the Defence Motion of Utmost Urgency to Resolve all Difficulties posed by the File Processing and, in particular, Issues of Evidence Disclosure, Judicial Calendar and Non-Enforcement of Decisions of the Trial Chamber on the Ndayambaje Case, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndayambaje</i> . Case No. ICTR-96-8-T, T. Ch. II, 16 April 1998.	255
Decision on the Joint Defence Motion Requesting the Interpretation of Rules 67 of the Rules, <i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema and Ruzindana</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1-T, T. Ch. II, 15 June 1998	261
Decision on the Defence Motion for Pre-Determination of Rules of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-7-T, T. Ch. II, 8 July 1998.	265
Decision on the Defence Motion for Disclosure of Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Rutaganda</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-3-T. T. Ch. I, 4 September 1998.	271
Decision on the Defence Motion for Inadmissibility of Disclosure Based on the Decision of 11 June 1998. <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-7-T, T. Ch. II, 7 December 1998.	277
Judge Tafazzal H. Khan's Separate Declaration.	281
Commentary <i>Iorn Ongena</i>	284
8. Choice of Counsel	
Decision on the Motions of the Accused for Replacement of Assigned Counsel, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntakirutimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-10-T and Case No. ICTR-96-17-T, T. Ch. I, 11 June 1997	291
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ostrovsky on the Request of the Accused for Change of Assigned Counsel.	297
Decision relating to the Assignment of Counsel, <i>Akayesu v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-4-A, A. Ch., 27 July 1999.	299
Commentary <i>t/phons Orié</i>	302
9. Right to and Scope of Appeal	
Decision on the Admissibility of the Prosecutor's Appeal from the Decision of a Confirming Judge Dismissing an Indictment Against Théoneste Bagosora and 28 Others, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora and 28 Others</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-37-A, A. Ch., 8 June 1998.	307
Declaration of Judge Mohamed Shahabuddeen on the Admissibility of the Prosecutor's Appeal from the Decision of a Confirming Judge Dismissing an Indictment against Théoneste Bagosora and 28 Others.	317
Decision on Appeal Against Oral Decision of Trial Chamber II of 28 September 1998, <i>Nsengiyumva v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-12-A, A. Ch., 3 June 1999.	319
Joint and Separate Opinion of Judge McDonald and Judge Vohrah	327
Joint Separate and Concurring Opinion of Judge Wang Tieya and Judge Rafael Nieto-Navia	335
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen.	337
Decision Rejecting Notice of Appeal, <i>Ntuyahaga v. Prosecutor</i> , ICTR-98-40-A, A. Ch., 3 June 1999.	339
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen.	341

Table of Contents

Decision on the Defence Motion for Interlocutory Appeal on the Jurisdiction of Trial Chamber I, <i>Prosecutor v. Kanyabashi</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-15-A, A. Ch., 3 June 1999.	343
Joint and Separate Opinion of Judge McDonald and Judge Vohrah	351
Joint Separate and Concurring Opinion of Judge Wang Tieya and Judge Rafael Nieto-Navia	363
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen	373
Commentary <i>FJies van Sliedregt</i>	388
 <i>Part 4 Judgement and Sentencing</i>	
10. Judgement	
Judgement. <i>Prosecutor v. Akayesu</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, T. Ch. I, 2 September 1998.	399
Commentary <i>William Schabas</i>	539
11. Judgement and Sentence	
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema and Ruzindana</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1-T, T. Ch. II, 21 May 1999.	555
Commentary <i>Andre Klip</i>	677
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Judge Tafazzal Hossain Khan Regarding the Verdicts under the Charges of Crimes Against Humanity/Murder and Crimes Against Humanity/Extermination	682
Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema and Ruzindana</i> , Case No. ICTR-95-1-T, T. Ch. II, 21 May 1999.	693
Commentary <i>Kai Ambos and Steffen Wirth</i>	701
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Rutaganda</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-3-T, T. Ch. I, 6 December 1999.	709
Commentary <i>Andre Klip</i>	787
12. Judgement Sentence and Plea of Guilty	
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Kambanda</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-23-S, T. Ch. I, 4 September 1998.	793
Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Akayesu</i> , Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, T. Ch. I, 2 October 1998.	809
Decision Relating to a Plea of Guilty, <i>Prosecutor v. Serushago</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-39-T, T. Ch. I, 14 December 1998.	819
Sentence. <i>Prosecutor v. Serushago</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-39-S, T. Ch. I, 5 February 1999.	823
Commentary <i>Kai Ambos and Jan-Christoph Nemitz</i>	835
Index.	841
Contributors and editors.	845