

Human Rights Law Journal · HRLJ

HRLJ

30 September 2022

Vol. 42 (2022) No. 1-9

ISSN 0174/4704

Pages 1-340

1. ARTICLES

- Angelika Nußberger, Cologne**
The Future of European Human Rights Protection – On the Question of the *status quo* in Twenty Years' Time..... 1
- Robert Spano, Strasbourg**
The European Court of Human Rights in 2040 – Lost Utopia or Trademark of the 21st Century ? 5
- Koen Lenaerts, Luxembourg**
The European Court of Justice in 2040 – Pacemaker of European Integration or Lost in Transition ?..... 9
- Jonathan Mance, London**
Britain on Its Own – The Way Forward to Tradition ? 15
- Mary Arden, London / Adam Bodnar, Warsaw /**
Lado Chanturia, Strasbourg / Angelika Nußberger, Cologne / Ganna Yudkivska, Kyiv
Human Rights for the Future – A Chance for Peace ?..... 18
- Theodor Shulman, Munich**
“Not Deeply Rooted” ? – A Commentary on the Supreme Court’s Decision to Eliminate the Federal Constitutional Right to Abortion..... 27

2. DECISIONS and REPORTS

- UN Human Rights Committee (UN-HRCee), Geneva**
- 21.VII.22 – Impact of adverse climate change on low-lying islands / Violation of the State’s positive obligation to protect the authors’ rights under the Covenant (Article 17 – home, private life and family; Article 27 – enjoyment of minority culture) / *Billy et al. v. Australia*..... 34
- International Court of Justice (ICJ), The Hague**
- 16.III.22 – Russian military operations since 24 February 2022 in the territory of Ukraine / Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide / Provisional measures ordered / *Ukraine v. Russian Federation* 46
- European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg**
- 15.III.22 – Judicial reforms in Poland weakening judicial independence: Issue examined for the first time by the Grand Chamber / Premature ending of mandate for a member of the Polish National Council of the Judiciary violates Article 6 ECHR (right to access to a court) / *Grzęda v. Poland (GC)*..... 63
- 5.IV.22 – Novel questions regarding freedom and pluralism of broadcasting / Licence revocation of a private television channel / No violation of freedom of expression (Article 10 ECHR) and the right to property (Article 1 Protocol No. 1) / *NIT S.R.L. v. Moldova (GC)* 123
- 11.VII.22 – Failure to fulfil the *Kavala* judgment of 10 December 2019 which called on the Government to end the applicant’s detention and secure his immediate release / Infringement proceedings under the terms of Article 46 § 4 ECHR / *Kavala v. Türkiye (GC)* 157
- 14.IX.22 – Request for repatriation of French nationals held in camps in Syria: Application partly inadmissible due to lack of France’s jurisdiction (Article 1 ECHR) regarding complaint of ill-treatment / Applicants cannot claim a *general right* to repatriation based on Article 3 § 2 of Protocol No. 4 (right to enter national territory), but they must be afforded a decision-making process by appropriate safeguards against arbitrariness / *H.F. et al. v. France (GC)* 183
- 8.IV.22 – *Advisory Opinion requested by the Lithuanian Supreme Administrative Court*: Criteria to be applied in the assessment of whether the ban preventing a former Member of Parliament (Ms. N.V.), removed in impeachment proceedings from standing for election to the *Seimas* has become disproportionate with the consequence that it breaches Article 3 of Protocol No. 1 (the right to free elections)..... 221

(Contents continued on the next page)



N. P. Engel, Publisher

www.hrlj.info

e-mail: N.P.Engel@HRLJ.info

Human Rights Law Journal

HRLJ • and continuation of The Human Rights Review

Editorial Advisory Board:

Thomas Buergenthal, Washington, D.C. • Antônio Cançado Trindade†, The Hague • Tim Eicke, Strasbourg •
Jochen Abr. Frowein, Heidelberg • Anatoly Kovler, Moscow • Paul Mahoney, Strasbourg •
Jörg Paul Müller, Bern • Willibald P. Pahr, Vienna • Guido Raimondi, Rome • Sonia Picado Sotela,
San José (Costa Rica) • The Right Hon. Lord Mance, London • William A. Schabas, London •
Christian Tomuschat, Berlin

Editor-in-Chief: Erika Engel

Associate Editor: John Packer, Ottawa

Table of Contents Vol. 42 (2022) No. 1-9 (continued)

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
- 26.IV.22 – <i>Advisory Opinion requested by the Armenian Court of Cassation: The national court asks for guidance in the context of the execution of the ECtHR judgment in Virabyan v. Armenia of 2012 leading to a criminal case on torture declared time-barred / Scope and nature of Article 3 (prohibition of torture) and Article 7 (no punishment without law).....</i>	234
- 13.VII.22 – <i>Advisory Opinion requested by the French Conseil d'État / The question concerned the difference in treatment of the landowners' associations set up before and after the creation of an approved municipal hunters' association / Application of Article 14 (prohibition of discrimination) taken together with Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 (protection of property).....</i>	248
Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), Luxembourg	
- 22.II.22. – <i>Principle of the primacy of EU law / Effect of decisions of a constitutional court / Independence of the judiciary requires that a national judge (here: in Romania) may not incur disciplinary liability on the ground that he applied EU law – as interpreted by the CJEU – but thereby departing from the case-law of its own Constitutional Court / Case of RS.....</i>	261
- 5.IV.22 – <i>Stringent criteria to be applied regarding the limited admissibility of the general and indiscriminate retention of traffic and location data relating to electronic communications (here: in Ireland) / Commissioner of An Garda Síochána et al.</i>	268
- 20.IX.22 – <i>EU law precludes national legislation which provides – on a preventive basis – for the general and indiscriminate retention of traffic and location data (here: in Germany) / Confirmation of previous case-law (see above at p. 268) / SpaceNet and Telekom Deutschland</i>	283
- 7.IX.22 – <i>Defence and promotion of the official language of a Member State (here: in Latvia) / Organisation of the education system / Cilevičs et al.</i>	298
UK Supreme Court, London	
- 6.VII.22 – <i>Functions of diplomatic missions in general protected by immunity / Trafficking and exploitation of a domestic worker (a national of the Philippines) in the household of a diplomat (representing Saudi Arabia in the UK) not covered by immunity if the alleged form of modern slavery is proved / Judgment rendered by a majority of three to two / Basfar (Respondent) v. Wong (Appellant).....</i>	304
German Federal Constitutional Court, Karlsruhe	
- 27.IV.22 – <i>Unsuccessful constitutional complaint challenging the obligation for staff in the health and care sectors to provide proof of vaccination against COVID-19</i>	325
3. DOCUMENTATION	
Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, Strasbourg	
- 16.III.22 – <i>Cessation of the membership of the Russian Federation to the Council of Europe as from 16 March 2022</i>	339
European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
- 22.III.22 – <i>Consequences of the cessation of Russia's membership to the Council of Europe.....</i>	339
- 5.IX.22 – <i>Office of a judge with respect to the Russian Federation ceases to exist on 16 September 2022</i>	339
4. PENDING PROCEEDINGS	
European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), Strasbourg	
- 14.VI.22 – <i>Urgent interim measure granted in case concerning asylum-seeker's imminent removal from the UK to Rwanda / N.S.K. v. United Kingdom.....</i>	340

