



VOLUME 61

# Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

The International  
Criminal Court  
2012–2014

André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.)  
Victoria Häberle (assistant editor)

## CONTENTS

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Contents</b> .....   | 5   |
| <b>Preface</b> .....  | 9   |
| <br><b>Admissibility</b>  |     |
| Decision Requesting Further Submissions on Issues Related to the Admissibility of the Case against Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Semussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 7 December 2012 .....   | 11  |
| Commentary <i>Claire Boost</i> .....  | 23  |
| <br><b>Issues Relating to Appeal / Leave to Appeal</b>  |     |
| Decision on the “Defence Application for Leave to Appeal the ‘Decision on the Defence Request for a Temporary Stay of Proceedings’”, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09, T. Ch. IV, 13 December 2012 .....   | 29  |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Eboc-Osuji .....  | 39  |
| Decision on an Application for Leave to Appeal Submitted by the Defence of Abdullah Al-Semussi, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Semussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11–01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 28 August 2013 .....  | 51  |
| Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 3 June 2013 entitled “Decision Adjourning the Hearing on the Confirmation of Charges pursuant to Article 61(7) (c)(i) of the Rome Statute”, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11 OA 5, A. Ch., 16 December 2013 ..... | 65  |
| Decision on the Admissibility of the Appeal against the “Decision on the Application for the Interim Release of Detained Witnesses DRC-D02-P-0236, DRC-D02-P-0228 and DRC-D02-P-0350”, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/07 OA 14, A. Ch., 20 January 2014 .....   | 83  |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Song .....  | 93  |
| Commentary <i>Rebecca Heemskerk</i> .....   | 97  |
| <br><b>Reparations</b>  |     |
| Decision on the Admissibility of the Appeals against Trial Chamber I’s “Decision Establishing the Principles and Procedures to be Applied to Reparations” and Directions on the Further Conduct of Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga Dyilo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/06 A A2 A3 OA 21, A. Ch., 14 December 2012 .....     | 107 |
| Commentary <i>Manon Bax</i> .....   | 130 |
| <br><b>Stay / Termination of Proceedings and Withdrawal of Charges</b>  |     |
| Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Laurent Koudou Gbagbo against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I on Jurisdiction and Stay of the Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11 OA 2, A. Ch., 12 December 2012 .....   | 135 |
| Decision on the Withdrawal of Charges against Mr Muthaura, <i>Prosecutor v. Muthaura and Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V, 18 March 2013 .....   | 159 |
| Partial Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ozaki and Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboc-Osuji .....   | 165 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Decision on Defence Application pursuant to Article 64(4) and Related Requests, <i>Prosecutor v. Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V, 26 April 2013 .....  | 177 |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Ozaki .....  | 202 |
| Concurring Opinion of Judge Christine Van den Wyngaert .....   | 203 |
| Corrigendum of Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboc-Osuji .....   | 205 |
| Decision on Defence Application for a Permanent Stay of Proceedings due to Abuse of Process, <i>Prosecutor v. Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–02/11, T. Ch. V(B), 5 December 2013 .....  | 227 |
| Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboc-Osuji .....  | 247 |
| Commentary <i>Luca Poltronieri Rossetti</i> .....  | 250 |
| <br><b>Disqualification of Judges</b>  |     |
| Decision of the Plenary of Judges on the Defence Application of 20 February 2013 for the Disqualification of Judge Sang-Hyun Song from the case of <i>The Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo</i> , 11 June 2013 .....  | 259 |
| Commentary <i>Michele Caianiello</i> .....   | 273 |
| <br><b>Change of Location of Proceedings</b>   |     |
| Decision of the Plenary of Judges on the Joint Defence Application for a Change of Place where the Court Shall Sit for Trial in the case of <i>The Prosecutor v. William Samoei Ruto and Joshua Arap Sang</i> , 26 August 2013 .....   | 281 |
| Decision on the Defence Application to Vacate the Decision of the Plenary of Judges on the “Joint Defence Application for a Change of Place where the Court Shall Sit for Trial” in the case of <i>The Prosecutor v. William Samoei Ruto and Joshua Arap Sang, Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-01/11, The Presidency, 6 September 2013 .....                        | 291 |
| Commentary <i>Irene Milazzo</i> .....  | 296 |
| <br><b>Other Procedural Issues</b>   |     |
| Decision on Witness Preparation, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11, T. Ch. V, 2 January 2013 .....   | 307 |
| Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Eboc-Osuji .....  | 318 |
| Decision on the Joint Defence Request for Leave to Appeal the Decision on Witness Preparation, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11, T. Ch. V, 11 February 2013 .....   | 335 |
| Concurring Separate Opinion of Judge Eboc-Osuji .....  | 342 |
| Decision on the Protocol on the Handling of Confidential Information and Contact of Between a Party and Witnesses of the Opposing Party, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09, T. Ch. IV, 18 February 2013 .....  | 345 |
| Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Abdallah Banda Abakaer Nourain and Mr Salah Mohammed Jerbo Jamus against the Decision of Trial Chamber IV of 23 January 2013 entitled “Decision on the Defence’s Request for Disclosure of Documents in the Possession of the Office of the Prosecutor”, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05–03/09 OA 4, A. Ch., 28 August 2013 ..... | 361 |
| Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Germain Katanga against the Decision of Trial Chamber II of 21 November 2012 entitled “Decision on the Implementation of Regulation 55 of the Regulations of the Court and Severing the Charges against the Accused Persons”, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–01/07 OA 13, A. Ch., 27 March 2013 .....                                    | 375 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Cuno Tarfusser .....   | 398 |
| Decision Transmitting Additional Legal and Factual Material (Regulation 55(2) and 55(3) of the Regulations of the Court), <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 15 May 2013.....   | 405 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Christine Van den Wyngaert .....   | 415 |
| Commentary <i>Alexander Heinze</i> .....   | 426 |
| <b>Victims</b>   |     |
| Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Banda and Jerbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-03/09 OA 4, A. Ch., 6 May 2013 .....   | 443 |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song .....   | 449 |
| Decision on the Application by Victims for Participation in the Appeal, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11-01/11 OA 4, A. Ch., 27 August 2013 .....  | 451 |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song .....   | 457 |
| Commentary <i>Suzan van der Aa</i> .....   | 458 |
| <b>Responsibilities/ Rights of States</b>  |     |
| Decision on the “Urgent Application on behalf of Abdullah Al-Senussi for Pre-Trial Chamber to Order the Libyan Authorities to Comply with their Obligations and the Orders of the ICC”, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11-01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 6 February 2013 .....  | 465 |
| Decision on the “Government of Libya’s Application for Leave to Appeal the “Decision on the Urgent Application on behalf of Abdullah Al-Senussi for Pre-Trial Chamber to Order the Libyan Authorities to Comply with their Obligations and the Orders of the ICC””, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11-01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 25 February 2013 ..... | 473 |
| Decision on Libya’s Postponement of the Execution of the Request for Arrest and Surrender of Abdullah Al-Senussi pursuant to Article 95 of the Rome Statute and related Defence Request to Refer Libya to the UN Security Council, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaddafi and Al-Senussi</i> , Case No. ICC-01/11-01/11, P.T. Ch. I, 14 June 2013.....                                       | 481 |
| Decision on the Requests for Leave to submit Observations under Rule 103 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-01/11 OA 5, A. Ch., 13 September 2013.....  | 491 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka.....  | 496 |
| Commentary <i>Michael Kelly</i> .....  | 498 |
| <b>Interim Release of Detained Witnesses</b>   |     |
| Decision on the application for the interim release of detained Witnesses DRC02-P-0236, DRC-D02-P-0228 and DRC-D02-P-0350, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 1 October 2013 .....  | 503 |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Van den Wyngaert .....   | 514 |
| Commentary <i>André Klip</i> .....   | 520 |
| <b>Presence of Accused at Trial</b>  |     |
| Decision on Defence Request for Conditional Excusal from Continuous Presence at Trial, <i>Prosecutor v. Kenyatta</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09-02/11, T. Ch. V(B), 18 October 2013 .....  | 531 |

|   |         |
|---|---------|
| Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ozaki .....   | 559     |
| Separate Further Opinion of Judge Eboe-Osuji .....  | 563     |
| Judgment on the Appeal of the Prosecutor against the Decision of Trial Chamber V(a) of 18 June 2013 entitled “Decision on Mr Ruto’s Request for Excusal from Continuous Presence at Trial”, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruto and Sang</i> , Case No. ICC-01/09–01/11 OA 5, A. Ch., 25 October 2013 .....                           | 573     |
| Joint Separate Opinion of Judge Kourula and Judge Ušacka .....  | 590     |
| Commentary <i>Diletta Marchesi</i> .....  | 595     |
| <br><b>Review of Detention</b>  |         |
| Judgment on the Appeal of Mr Laurent Gbagbo against the Decision of Pre-Trial Chamber I of 11 July 2013 entitled “Third decision on the Review of Laurent Gbagbo’s Detention pursuant to Article 60(3) of the Rome Statute”, <i>Prosecutor v. Gbagbo</i> , Case No. ICC-02/11–01/11 OA 4, A. Ch., 29 October 2013 ..... | 605     |
| Separate Opinion of Judge Kourula .....   | 631     |
| Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ušacka .....  | 632     |
| Commentary <i>Rebecca Heemskerk</i> .....   | 637     |
| <br><b>Article 74 Judgment</b>  |         |
| Judgment pursuant to Article 74 of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Ngudjolo</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04–02/12, T. Ch. II, 18 December 2012 .....   | 645     |
| Concurring Opinion of Judge Van den Wyngaert .....  | 741     |
| Commentary <i>André Klip</i> .....  | 763     |
| <br><b>Contributors and Editors</b> .....   | <br>775 |