



VOLUME 58

# Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

The International Criminal  
Tribunal for Rwanda  
2013-2014

André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.)  
Victoria Häberle (assistant editor)



INTERSENTIA

## CONTENTS

<b>Contents</b> .....	5
<b>Preface</b> .....	7
<b>Part I. Procedural Matters</b>	
<b>Referral, Rule 11bis and national proceedings</b>	
Decision on Bernard Munyagishari's Third and Fourth Motions for Admission of Additional Evidence and on the Appeals against the Decision on Referral under Rule 11bis, <i>Munyagishari v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-05-89-AR11bis, A. Ch., 3 May 2013.....	9
Decision in Respect to the Application for Variation of Protective Measures, <i>Prosecutor v. Gatete</i> , Case No. MICT-13-42, Single Judge, 15 May 2013 .....	55
Decision on the Registrar's Submission Regarding the Monitoring Mechanisms in the <i>Uwinkindi</i> and <i>Munyagishari</i> Cases, <i>Prosecutor v. Uwinkindi and Munyagishari</i> , Case Nos. MICT-12-20 and MICT-12-25, Pres. MICT, 15 November 2013.....	61
Commentary <i>Peta-Louise Bagott</i> .....	81
<b>Fair trial and defence facilities</b>	
Decision on Motion to Quash Decision of Suspension and to Re-instate Defence Team Legal Assistant, <i>Prosecutor v. Ngirabatware</i> , Case No. MICT-12-29-A, Pres. MICT, 19 March 2013.....	87
Decision on Motion to Quash and Revise a Decision of the Registrar on the Level of Complexity and Seeking further Relief, <i>Ngirabatware v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. MICT-12-29-A, Pres. MICT, 26 February 2014 .....	95
Decision on Ngirabatware's Motions for Relief for Rule 73 Violations and Admission of Additional Evidence on Appeal, <i>Ngirabatware v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. MICT-12-29-A, A. Ch., 21 November 2014..	109
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Moloto .....	127
Decision on Niyitegeka's Request for Assignment of Counsel, <i>Niyitegeka v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. MICT-12-16-R, A. Ch., 6 November 2014 .....	131
Separate Concurring Opinion of Judge Antonetti .....	137
Commentary <i>Franziska Oehm</i> .....	139
<b>Part II. Judgements</b>	
<b>Mugenzi and Mugiraneza Judgement</b>	
Judgement, <i>Mugenzi and Mugiraneza v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-A, A. Ch., 4 February 2013 .....	143
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Robinson .....	199
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Liu .....	204
Commentary <i>Simon Meisenberg</i> .....	219
<b>Ndahimana Judgement</b>	
Judgement, <i>Ndahimana v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-68-A, A. Ch., 16 December 2013.....	223
Commentary <i>Gennady Esakov</i> .....	325

### **Ndindiliyimana, Nzuwonemeye and Sagahutu Judgement**

Judgement, <i>Ndindiliyimana, Nzuwonemeye and Sagahutu v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-56-A, A. Ch., 11 February 2014.	331
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Tuzmukhamedov	488
Commentary <i>Mathias Holvoet</i>	512

### **Bizimungu Judgement**

Judgement, <i>Bizimungu v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-56B-A, A. Ch., 30 June 2014.	519
Separate Declaration of Judge Liu	666
Commentary <i>Hendrik Vandekerckhove</i>	683

### **Karemra and Ngirumpatse Judgement**

Judgement, <i>Karemra and Ngirumpatse v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-A, A. Ch., 29 September 2014.	687
Partially Dissenting and Separate Opinions of Judge Pocar	951
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ramaroson	962
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Tuzmukhamedov	967
Separate, Partially Dissenting and Dissenting Opinions of Judge Afande	975
Commentary <i>Hugo Lagacé</i>	1000

### **Ngirabatware Judgement**

Judgement, <i>Ngirabatware v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. MICT-12-29-A, A. Ch., 18 December 2014.	1017
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Moloto	1115
Commentary <i>Michail Vagias</i>	1134

## **Part III. Post-conviction issues**

### **Review and early release**

Decision on Request for Review, <i>Kajelijeli v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44A-R, A. Ch., 29 May 2013.	1141
Partial Dissenting Opinion of Judge Robinson	1168
Decision of the President on the Early Release of Obdet Ruzindana, <i>Prosecutor v. Ruzindana</i> , Case No. MICT-12-10-ES, Pres. MICT, 13 March 2014	1173
Public Redacted Version of the 26th March 2014 Decision of the President on the Early Release of Gérard Ntakirutimana, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntakirutimana</i> , Case No. MICT-12-17-ES, Pres. MICT, 24 April 2014	1181
Commentary <i>Karel De Meester</i>	1189
<b>List of Contributors and Editors</b>	1193