



# **Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals**

**V O L U M E**

**The International  
Criminal Tribunal  
for Rwanda 2005**

**André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)**



intersentia

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Table of Contents</b> .....	5
<b>Preface</b> .....	11
<b>Part 1/ Preliminary matters</b>	
<b>1. Issues related to the indictment</b>	
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Renzaho</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-31-I, T. Ch. II, 18 March 2005. ....	13
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Motion to Dismiss for Selective Prosecution (Articles 15, 17(1) and 20(1) of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 22 March 2005. ....	23
Decision on Prosecution Interlocutory Appeal Against Trial Chamber II Decision of 23 February 2005, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-55A-AR73, A. Ch., 12 May 2005. ....	27
Decision on Count Seven of the Amended Indictment - Violence to Life, Health and Physical or Mental Well-Being of Persons (Article 4(a) of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-A4(a), T. Ch. III, 5 August 2005. ....	43
Decision on Defence Motion Challenging the Jurisdiction of the Tribunal - Joint Criminal Enterprise (Rule 72 and 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> . Case No. ICTR-98-44-R72, T. Ch. III, 5 August 2005. ....	47
Decision on Kabiligi Request for Particulars of the Amended Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 27 September 2005. ....	51
Decision on the Prosecutor's Request for Leave to Amend the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bisengimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-60-I, T. Ch. II, 27 October 2005. ....	57
Commentary <i>Astrid Reisinger Coracini</i> . ....	64
<b>Part 2/ Procedural matters</b>	
<b>2. Fair trial</b>	
Decision on Motion to Compel Accused to Testify Prior to Other Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 11 January 2005. ....	79
Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion Pursuant to Rule 73(B) for Certification to Appeal the Decision Denying Leave to File an Amended Indictment and for Stay of Proceedings, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-2000-55A-T, T. Ch. II, 16 March 2005. ....	83
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Motion for Order Finding Prior Decisions to be of "No Effect" (Rules 46(A) and 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 24 May 2005. ....	87

Decision on the Defence Motions for Reconsideration of Protective Measures for Prosecution Witnesses (Rule 73 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 29 August 2005. . . . .	91
Decision on the "Requête d'Arsène Shalim Ntahobali en Autorisation de Rencontrer le Detenu Georges Rutaganda en l'Absence d'un Représentant du Procureur et du Greffe" (Article 20, Statute of the Tribunal and Rule 73, Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko and Ntahobali</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 21 September 2005. . . . .	95
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera's Motion for Reconsideration or Certification to Appeal Decision on Motion for Order Allowing Meeting with Defence Witness (Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 11 October 2005. . . . .	101
Decision on the Defence Motion for Admission of the Defence Investigator to Closed Hearings of Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Seromba</i> , Case. No. ICTR-T-2001-66-T, T. Ch. III, 8 November 2005. . . . .	105
Commentary <i>Anne Pieter van der Mei</i> . . . . .	108
 3. Joinder	
Decision on Severance of Andre Rwamakuba and for Leave to File Amended Indictment (Articles 6, II, <i>Xlquater</i> and 20 of the Statute; Rules 47, 50 and 82(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse^ Nzirorera and Rwamakuba^</i> Case No. ICTR-98-44-PT, T. Ch. III, 14 February 2005. . . . .	119
Decision on Request for Severance by Accused Kabiligi, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 24 March 2005. . . . .	133
Commentary <i>Masha Fedorova</i> . . . . .	139
 4. Undue delay	
Decision on Defence Motion for Stay of Proceedings (Article 20 of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-PT, T. Ch. III, 3 June 2005. . . . .	147
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Reconsideration or, in the Alternative, Certification to Appeal Chamber's Decision Denying Request for Adjournment (Article 19 of the Statute and Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 29 September 2005. . . . .	157
Commentary <i>Susana Assis Martins</i> . . . . .	164
 5. Disclosure	
Decision on Motion to Unseal <i>Ex Parte</i> Submissions and to Strike Paragraphs 32.4 and 49 from the Amended Indictment (Rule 66(A)(1) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-R66, T. Ch. III, 3 May 2005. . . . .	171
Decision on Disclosure of Materials Relating to Immigration Statements of Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 27 September 2005. . . . .	177

Decision on Defence Urgent Motion to Exclude Some Parts of the Prosecution Pre-Trial Brief (Rule 736is of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Zigiranyirazo</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-73-PT, T. Ch. HI, 30 September 2005. . . . .	183
Decision on Interlocutory Appeals of Decision on Witness Protection Orders, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-AR73 & ICTR-98-41-AR73(B), A. Ch.. 6 October 2005. . . . .	189
Commentary <i>Desi Stoitchkova</i> . . . . .	202
6. Witnesses and protective measures	
Decision on Admission of Statements of Deceased Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. 1,19 January 2005. . . . .	209
Decision on Nyiramasuhuko's Strictly Confidential <i>Ex-Parte</i> - Under Seal - Motion for Additional Protective Measures for Some Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, Joint Case No. ICTR-98-42-T, T. Ch. II, 1 March 2005. . . . .	219
Decision on the Prosecution Motion for Sanctions Against Counsel for Nzirorera for Violation of Witness Protection Order and for an Injunction Against Further Violations (Rule 46(A) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ngirumpatse and Nzirorera</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-R46, T. Ch. III, 19 April 2005. . . . .	231
Decision on Defence Motion for Exclusion of Portions of Testimony of Expert Witness Dr. Alison des Forges, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu, Mugenzi, Bicamumpaka and Mugiraneza</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 2 September 2005. . . . .	235
Decision on Defence Motion to Recall Prosecution Witness OAB for Cross-Examination, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. 1,19 September 2005. . . . .	245
Decision on Defence Motion for Protective Measures (Rules 69 and 75 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence), <i>Prosecutor v. Rwamakuba</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44C-T, T. Ch. III, 21 September 2005 ..	249
Decision on Exclusion of Testimony Outside the Scope of the Indictment, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 27 September 2005. . . .	253
Decision on the Prosecution's Request to add Witness AHY, <i>Prosecutor v. Mpambara</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-65-T. T. Ch. 1, 27 September 2005. . . . .	261
Decision on Tharcisse Muvunyi's Motion for Protection of Defence Witnesses, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> Case No. ICTR-2000-55A-T, T. Ch. II, 20 October 2005. . . . .	265
Commentary <i>Ousman Njikam</i> . . . . .	271
7. ICRC	
Reasons for the Chamber's Decision on the Accused's Motion to Exclude Witness TQ, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvuryu</i> Case No. ICTR-2000-55A-T, T. Ch. II, 15 July 2005. . . . .	279
Commentary <i>Shamiso Zinzombe</i> . . . . .	284

**8. Counsel**

Decision on the Defence Motion for the Reinstatement of Jean Yaovi Degli as Lead Counsel for Graden Kabitigi, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 19 January 2005. . . . . 289

Decision on Request for Private Representation of Gratien Kabiligi, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 4 March 2005. . . . . 303

Decision on Request for Certification of Appeal Concerning Private Representation, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 24 March 2005. . . . . 309

Decisions on Maitre Paul Skolnik's Application for Reconsideration of the Chamber's Decision to Instruct the Registrar to Assign him as Lead Counsel for Gratien Kabiligi, *Prosecutor v. Bagosora, Kabiligi, Ntabakuze and Nsengiyumva*, Case No. ICTR-98-41-T, T. Ch. I, 24 March 2005. . . . . 313

Commentary *Steven Freeland*. . . . . 322

**Part 3/ Rights of a detained person**

**9. Right to marry**

Registrar's Decision Pursuant to Article 8(3) (C) on the Request for Marriage and Other Reliefs, *Ngeze v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-99-52A, Registrar, 12 January 2005. . . . . 331

Decision on Hassan Ngeze's Application for Review of the Registrar's Decision of 12 January 2005, *Ngeze v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-1999-52-A, Pres., 14 September 2005. . . . . 337

Decision on Hassan Ngeze's Application to set Aside President Mose's Decision and Request to Consummate his Marriage, *Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, A. Ch., 6 December 2005. . . . . 343

Commentary *Dov Jacobs*. . . . . 346

**10. Conditions of detention**

Request for Reversal of Decision Prohibiting Contact With Other Detainees, *Prosecutor v. Munyakazi*, Case No. ICTR-97-36-I, Pres., 15 February 2005. . . . . 355

Request for Reversal of the Prohibition of Contact, *Ngeze v. Prosecutor*, Case No. ICTR-99-52-A, Pres., 29 July 2005. . . . . 359

Commentary *Caroline Fournet*. . . . . 362

**Part 4/ Judgement and sentencing**

**11. Judgements**

Judgement and Sentence, *Prosecutor v. Rutaganira*, Case No. ICTR-95-1C-T, T. Ch. III, 14 March 2005. . . . . 373

Commentary *Katalin Ligeti*. . . . . 403

Judgement and Sentence, *Prosecutor v. Muhimana*, Case No. ICTR-95-1B-T, T. Ch. III, 28 April 2005. . . . . 413

Commentary <i>Michael Bohlander</i> . . . . .	516
Judgement, <i>Semanza v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-20-A, A. Ch., 20 May 2005. . . . .	525
Separate Opinion of Judge Shahabuddeen and Judge Güney. . . . .	611
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar. . . . .	613
Commentary <i>Fiarían Jessberger and Oliver Schüttpelz</i> . . . . .	620
Judgement, <i>Kajelijeli v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44A-A, A. Ch., 23 May 2005. . . . .	625
Commentary <i>Maria Kaiafa-Gbandi and Yannis Naziris</i> . . . . .	711
Judgement, <i>Kamuhanda v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-54A-A, A. Ch., 19 September 2005_____	721
Separate Opinion of Presiding Judge Theodor Meron . . . . .	806
Separate Opinion of Judge Wolfgang Schomburg_____	807
Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Mohamed Shahabuddeen . . . . .	813
Separate Opinion of Judge Inés Monica Weinberg de Roca on Paragraph 77 of the Judgement_	817
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Inés Monica Weinberg de Roca . . . . .	818
Commentary <i>Suzannah Linton</i> . . . . .	831
Index . . . . .	849
Contributors and Editors. . . . .	853