446

2025

ACADÉMIE DE DROIT INTERNATIONAL

FONDÉE EN 1923 AVEC LE CONCOURS DE LA
DOTATION CARNEGIE POUR LA PAIX INTERNATIONALE

RECUEIL DES COURS

COLLECTED COURSES OF THE HAGUE ACADEMY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

2025

Tome 446 de la collection

BRILL | NIJHOFF

Leiden/Boston

GENERAL TABLE OF CONTENTS

On the Interface Between Public and Private International Law, General Course on International Law, by C. MCLACHLAN, Professor at the University of Cambridge 9-304

Natural Justice in Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Judgments, by A. DICKINSON, Professor at the University of Oxford 305-546

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface 23

Part One. On conceptions of law outside the State 27

Chapter I. The public/private divide in international law 28

A. On conceptions of law outside the State 28

1. The state we are in 28
2. Peak law? 29

(a) Codification unbound 29
(b) International litigation: A refracting mirror 31

3. The function of law in the international community 31

(a) "All the light we cannot see" 31
(b) The interface between public and private international law . 32

4. Different functions of law in a global community 34

(a) Public international law: "Convergent approaches" 34
(b) Private international law: "Laterally coordinate approaches". 35

B. On the public/private divide in international law 36

1. Sovereignty and property 36
2. Two legal persons 38
3. Mixed identities: The East India companies 40
4. Choices of legal forms: Public or private? 41

C. Lost in translation: Neglected issues at the interface 43

Chapter II. On public international law 45

A. The public functions of public international law 45

1. Public international law as primarily a law of inter-State relations 45
2. Public purposes 47

B. The influence of private law on public international law 50

1. Sources 50
2. Choice of law 51
3. Jurisdiction 53
4. International judicial cooperation 53

C. Public international law recognition of a role for private international law 54

1. The right to self-determination 54
2. Private law claims and status 55

D. Limitations of the public international law model 56

Chapter III. On private international law 59

A. The private function of private international law 59

1. Allocative function: A system of secondary rules 59
2. Pluralism 61
3. Genealogy 61
4. Private international law as a law of interpersonal relations . . . 64
5. Private purposes 67

B. The influence of public international law on private international law 70
1. Prescriptive jurisdiction . . . 70
2. The functions of comity . . . 71
3. Public international law as the applicable law . . . 72
C. Limitations and opportunities of the private international law model 73
1. Opportunities . . . 73
2. Limitations . . . 76

Chapter IV. International arbitration: a semi-autonomous system . . . 77

A. Introduction . . . 77
B. A private realm beyond the State . . . 79
1. Creation of the essential pillars of the contemporary system . . . 79
2. Constituent elements . . . 81
3. Character . . . 83
4. Reliance on the techniques of private international law . . . 84
(a) Choice of law . . . 84
(b) Choice of jurisdiction . . . 86
(c) Enforcement . . . 87
C. Connections with national law: A matter of perspective . . . 87
D. Relation with public international law . . . 89
E. Is arbitration a transnational legal system? . . . 90
1. Substantive law: A *lex mercatoria*? . . . 91
2. Procedure . . . 92

Chapter V. Transnational law beyond the State? . . . 95

A. Introduction . . . 95
B. Origins of an idea . . . 97
C. What is transnational law? . . . 99
1. A response to globalisation . . . 99
2. Private elements of transnational regulation . . . 100
3. The turn to legal pluralism . . . 100
4. Transnational law codified . . . 102
5. Transnational law as process . . . 106
D. Implications for contemporary practice . . . 108

Part Two. On the public/private interface . . . 111

Chapter VI. Public international law: pluralism or systemic integration? . 112

A. Introduction . . . 112
B. Public international law, plural or general? . . . 114
C. Public international law as a law of conflicts . . . 115
1. Regime theory and regime conflict in international relations . . . 115
2. Limitations of the conflictual paradigm . . . 117
3. The pluralist critique . . . 118
D. The search for system in international law . . . 122
1. Completeness . . . 122
2. Legal stability . . . 123
3. Unity . . . 124
4. Coherence in legal reasoning . . . 125
E. The principle of systemic integration in treaty interpretation . . . 127
1. Insights from practice . . . 127
2. Introduction into the general rule of interpretation in the VCLT . 128
3. Embrace in judicial practice . . . 128

4. Interpretation 131
5. The public purposes of systemic integration. 131

Chapter VII. State responsibility for the exercise of public power 133

A. Introduction 133
B. Foundations of State responsibility. 134

1. Essential elements. 134
2. The concept of the State 137
3. General approach 137
4. Contribution to systemic integration of public international law . 139

C. Relation with private law and private parties 140

1. Sources 140
2. Part one: Claims 141

(a) States as claimants 141
(b) Private parties as claimants 143

3. Part two: Remedies 145
4. Private law and public international law claims distinguished . . 147
5. Conclusion 149

Chapter VIII. Foreign relations law: public power – private remedies . . . 151

A. Introduction 151
B. Foreign relations law at the interface 152

1. A term of art? 152
2. Points of distinction. 153

C. Five conceptions of foreign relations law 154

1. Exclusionary. 155
2. Domestic reception of international law 157
3. Constitutional law. 158
4. Diplomatic. 159
5. Allocative: Application of the techniques of private international law. 160

D. Two contrasting applications. 163

1. Private claim against State officials for external exercise of public power 163
2. Foreign State claim: Public or private? 166

(a) Cultural heritage 167
(b) Defence of the State 169
(c) Tax/tax fraud 169

E. Conclusions 170

Chapter IX. Jurisdiction I: External exercise of public power 172

A. Introduction 172
B. The use and abuse of jurisdiction and extraterritoriality 173

1. Jurisdiction 173
2. Extraterritoriality 173

C. Proscription or prescription? 175

1. The function of connecting factors. 175
2. Allocation and overlapping jurisdiction 176
3. Prescriptive, judicial and enforcement jurisdiction 177

D. Territoriality and extraterritoriality: Exercise of power and its constraint. 178

1. The fallacy of reference to the doctrine of jurisdiction 178

2. A divided and tailored approach 182
3. Can international armed conflict be extra-jurisdictional? 183
E. Jurisdiction and the responsibility of the State and its officials 186
1. State responsibility 186
2. Personal accountability of public officials 186

Chapter X. Jurisdiction II: The control of private parties 187

A. Introduction 187
B. The public/private divide 188
1. Public international law and the exercise of public power 188
2. Private international law and the resolution of transnational private disputes 188
3. Reassessment 190
C. Jurisdiction over corporations 191
1. Public international choice of law rules for corporations 191
2. Private international law rules on the recognition of corporations and branches 192
3. Private international law jurisdiction over parent companies . . . 195
D. Regulatory control: Extraterritorial jurisdiction over effects 198
1. The "effects doctrine" and extraterritoriality: A unilateral assertion 198
2. The response of other States 199
3. Development of a sufficiency of connection test 200
4. American retrenchment 202
E. Comity and the jurisdictional interests of other States 203

Part Three. Private claims against the State 205

Chapter XI. Immunities I: Public power 206

A. Introduction 206
B. The public functions of State immunity 207
1. Jurisdictional immunities and the sovereign independence of States 207
2. Allocative function of limits on claims against foreign States . . 208
3. Connecting factors 209
C. Customary immunity and its material sources 210
1. National judicial decisions 210
2. National legislation 211
3. State practice in the formulation of treaties 212
D. Scope 212
1. Types of immunity 213
2. Types of jurisdiction 214
E. Immunity of individuals as State officials from international crimes . 215
1. In a private civil claim 215
2. Individual responsibility for international crimes before national courts 217
3. *Pinochet*: Implied waiver of immunity under the suppression conventions 221
4. The response of the ICJ 222
5. Controversy in the International Law Commission 224

Chapter XII. Immunities II: Private claims and the corporate State 228

A. Introduction 228

B. Immunity as allocation of jurisdiction over foreign States 228
C. The concept of commerciality and its function in immunity cases . . 230
1. Application of private international law to the foreign State . . . 230
2. Test of commerciality 231
D. The State-owned corporation: Private or public? 233
1. The State-owned corporation in the law of immunities 233
2. Separate legal personality and governmental activities 235
3. State responsibility and the public body 236

Chapter XIII. Investment arbitration I: Public law in private process . . . 240

A. Introduction 240
B. The hybrid public/private character of investment arbitration. 241
1. What is investment arbitration for? The alternative options . . . 241
2. The genesis of the ICSID Convention 245
3. Key private features of its design 247
(a) Choice of arbitration 247
(b) Modes of consent. 248
(c) Party appointment of arbitrators 250
(d) A nearly autonomous system 251
C. Public law elements 252
1. Internal 253
2. External 255
D. Process fix: From arbitration to a standing court/appellate mechanism? 258

Chapter XIV. Investment arbitration II: Applicable law – public and private. 261

A. Introduction 261
B. A mixed system of applicable law 261
1. Reasons for choice of law 261
2. A continuing role for host State law 262
C. Choice of law in investment arbitration 265
1. The Tribunal's powers 265
2. Myths and misconceptions about Article 42 ICSID Convention . 266
3. The choice of law process 268
D. Role of host State law 269
E. Role of international law 271
1. Investment treaties and the principle of systemic integration . . . 271
2. Applications 272
(a) General international law in the interpretation of primary treaty obligations 273
(b) General international law as applicable secondary rules . . . 275
(c) Reference to other treaty rules 276

Chapter XV. The once and future science of international law. 278

A. Introduction: Law amid constant change 278
1. The return of the State 278
2. Evanescent nature of States and corporations 279
3. Waning of State engagement 280
4. Academic criticism 280
B. International law as a science 281
1. Key elements 281

(a) Evidence of State practice 282
(b) The system of the law 282
(c) Underlying principles. 282
2. Balance between stability and change 283
3. Fundamental enduring elements 283
C. Characteristics of the contemporary international system 285
1. Multilateralism as a system-constitutive process 285
2. Plural by design: Internal self-determination and private international law 287
D. Coherence. 287
1. Why systemic integration matters now. 287
2. General principles of international law 290
(a) Non-aggression and non-intervention 292
(b) International environmental law 294
E. Conclusion 296
1. Politics and law: A false opposition 296
2. The international community 296

Selected bibliography 300

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter I. Foreign judgments in the conflict of laws 321

A. Introduction 321
B. Outline 327

Chapter II. A natural law toolbox 330

A. Natural law and natural justice 330
B. Setting the scene 337
C. Natural liberty 340
D. Equality and self-love in the natural order 343
E. Of (private) war and peace 345
F. Duties of humanity (mutual assistance) 348
G. Administering natural justice 350
H. The significance of the natural legal order 352
I. Political societies and the law of nature 353

1. The formation of political societies 353
2. The elasticity of consent as a guiding principle 355
3. Attachment to a political society 358
4. Territoriality and the scope of "sovereign" authority 359

J. Transforming natural law to the natural law of nations 362

1. Introduction 362
2. From the law of nature to the natural law of nations 363

(a) Personality 364
(b) Natural legal order and liberty 364
(c) Natural and political society and duties of humanity 365
(d) Equality of nations 367
(e) The administration of justice between nations 367

K. Summary and conclusions 369

Chapter III. Natural law and the recognition and enforcement of judgments 372

A. Fundamental questions 372
B. Grotius (reprise) 373
C. Going Dutch – Paulus and Johannes Voet, and Ulrik Huber 374

1. Introduction 374
2. Paulus Voet 376
3. Johannes Voet 377
4. Ulrik Huber 379
5. The scope of adjudicatory jurisdiction: Huber's first two axioms . 398
6. Comity as a bridge between legal orders 405

D. Reception and development in the eighteenth century 406

1. Reception into the common law 406

(a) Reception in Scotland (Part I) 406
(b) A look across the border: Early practice in England 409
(c) Reception in Scotland (Part 2) 411
(d) Lord Kames and Lord Mansfield 412
(e) Reception in Scotland (Part 3) 414
(f) Reception in England 415
(g) Reception in the United States 417

2. European evolution 418
(a) Vattel 418
(b) Louis Boullenois (1680-1762) 421
(c) Vattel's legacy 422
E. The nineteenth century: Revolution and evolution 424
1. Introduction 424
2. Natural law reasoning in early nineteenth century English case law 425
3. The incoming positivist tide 427
4. Wächter and Westlake 428
(a) Carl Georg von Wächter 428
(b) John Westlake 430
5. The legal positivist conundrum 433
6. Story and Savigny 435
(a) Joseph Story 435
(b) Friedrich Carl von Savigny 442
(c) Savigny on the recognition and enforcement of foreign judgments (reverie) 452
(d) Story and Savigny: Contrast and commonality 454
F. The contours of State practice 456
1. Reciprocity (I) – Austria 457
2. Reciprocity (II) – Germany 458
3. Substantive review (I) – France 459
4. Substantive review (II) – Kingdom of the Netherlands 460
5. Evidentiary function – Sweden 461
6. The common law method – Great Britain and the United States . . 462
7. Reciprocity free reception – Italy 472
8. Emerging patterns 473
G. Formal co-operation: In search of perfection 477
H. Global governance and human rights 486
I. Summary and conclusions 489

Chapter IV. Natural law's legacy: "Natural justice" as a ground of impeachment 490

A. Justice and injustice 490
B. Tools, techniques and terminology for addressing injustice in foreign judgments 493
1. Classifying the grounds of opposition 493
2. Breach of agreement and fraud: Perspective matters 495
3. "Natural justice": The common law's natural law artefact 496
4. "Natural justice": By any other name? 499
C. Levelling up 506
D. Adjudicatory jurisdiction: A question of natural justice? 508

Chapter V. Renaturalisation? 518

A. Introduction 518
1. Mutual aid 518
2. Peaceful resolution of disputes by means other than adjudication 519
3. Citizens of the world 520
B. Exposition 521
1. The pursuit of natural justice 521
2. Multidimensional justice 525

3. Adjudicatory jurisdiction: Seeking a "common judge" 527
4. Equal justice 531
5. A common enterprise 532
C. Summing up 534
Annex (Chapter IV.). Grounds for opposing recognition and enforcement of judgments 535
Bibliography 538