

# **Table of Content**

|   |    |
|---|----|
| <b>Introduction .....</b>   | 1  |
| 1. Objectives and Plan of the Study .....   | 1  |
| 2. Literature Review .....  | 9  |
| 3. Structure.....   | 20 |
| <b>Part I. Multilateral Debt Relief for Heavily Indebted Poor Countries .....</b>         | 23 |
| <b>A. The Heavily Indebted Poor Countries Initiative (HIPC) .....</b>                     | 26 |
| 1. Concessional Assistance to Low-Income Countries .....                                  | 26 |
| 2. The HIPC Framework .....   | 30 |
| 2.1. The Heavily Indebted Poor Country Initiative of 1996 .....                           | 33 |
| 2.2. The Cologne G-8 Summit of 1999 and HIPC II.....                                      | 39 |
| 2.3. Eligibility and Implementation under the Enhanced HIPC Framework .....               | 43 |
| 3. What kind of debt is addressed by HIPC? .....  | 48 |
| 4. HIPC Funding and Finances .....  | 50 |
| 4.1. The PRGF-HIPC Trust of the IMF .....   | 51 |
| 4.2. The World Bank HIPC Trust Fund .....   | 57 |
| 4.3. The IDA Debt Reduction Facility.....   | 60 |
| 4.4. HIPC Financing through Multilateral Creditors .....                                  | 61 |
| 4.5. Conclusion: Trust Fund Financing.....  | 62 |
| 5. HIPC Proceedings .....   | 63 |
| <b>B. Debt Relief under the G-8: The Multilateral Debt Relief Initiative (MDRI) .....</b> | 67 |
| 1. MDRI as Operational Successor of HIPC.....   | 69 |
| 2. Subsequent Changes in Lending Policies .....   | 74 |
| <b>C. Case Study: The Contemporary History of Debt Relief in Ghana.....</b>               | 77 |
| 1. Ghana's History with Economic Aid.....   | 80 |
| 2. Ghana's Reform Process under HIPC .....  | 86 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Part V. Conclusions .....</b>   | 289 |
| 1. HIPC as Role Model for an International Insolvency<br>Procedure for States? .....                                 | 291 |
| 2. “Soft Law versus Hard Law” – Soft Legal Regulation as Means<br>for Institutional Adaptation and Development ..... | 299 |
| 3. Legal Research on IMF and World Bank .....  | 303 |
| <b>Bibliography .....</b>  | 309 |
| <b>Index.....</b>  | 351 |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 2.6.5. Interacting Creditor Fora.....  | 224        |
| 2.6.6. Naming and Shaming .....  | 225        |
| 2.7. Assessment.....   | 225        |
| 3. Findings: HIPC as an Instrument of Global Governance .....                            | 229        |
| 3.1. Specifications of the HIPC Program's Soft Law Nature ....                           | 230        |
| 3.2. Global Governance Phenomena and the<br>International Legal Order .....              | 233        |
| <b>Part IV. Issues of Legitimacy .....</b>   | <b>237</b> |
| 1. Legitimacy: An Iridescent Concept.....  | 239        |
| 2. Charter Based Legitimacy of the HIPC Program .....                                    | 244        |
| 2.1. The Doctrine of <i>ultra vires</i> .....  | 245        |
| 2.2. Legal Analysis in the Light of the Bank and the<br>Fund's Mandate and Mission ..... | 247        |
| 2.3. Guiding Principles and Interpretative Methodology .....                             | 251        |
| 2.4. Findings .....  | 259        |
| 3. Issues of Sovereign Equality and Self-Determination.....                              | 260        |
| 3.1. Institutional Ownership .....   | 262        |
| 3.2. Conditionality .....  | 263        |
| 3.3. Findings .....  | 264        |
| 4. Procedural Accountability .....   | 266        |
| 4.1. Systemic and Sound Rulemaking.....  | 267        |
| 4.1.1. Policy Creation .....   | 267        |
| 4.1.2. The Decision Maker .....  | 268        |
| 4.1.3. Decision-Making Standards and Procedures.....                                     | 269        |
| 4.2. Transparency, Public Participation and the Right<br>to Information .....            | 271        |
| 4.2.1. Institutional Transparency .....  | 271        |
| 4.2.2. Access to Documents .....   | 273        |
| 4.2.3. Involvement of Stakeholders and Civil Society<br>Actors .....                     | 273        |
| 4.2.4. Complaint Procedures.....   | 274        |
| 4.3. Power Sharing and Institutional Checks and Balances .....                           | 275        |
| 4.3.1. Divided Authority and Delegation .....  | 275        |
| 4.3.2. Review of Board Decisions.....  | 277        |
| 4.4. Findings .....  | 278        |
| 5. Relief Achievements and Effectiveness of the HIPC Initiative....                      | 279        |
| 6. Findings and Recommendations.....   | 283        |

|        |   |     |
|--------|---|-----|
| 2.1.   | Implementation of the HIPC Framework .....  | 89  |
| 2.1.1. | Preliminary Documents .....   | 97  |
| 2.1.2. | Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy.....   | 98  |
| 2.1.3. | Decision Point Document .....   | 102 |
| 2.1.4. | Ghana's Completion Point .....  | 104 |
| 2.2.   | Donor Coordination under the Multi Donor Budgetary Support (MDBS) .....                   | 106 |
| 2.3.   | Civil Society Participation.....  | 108 |
| 3.     | Ghana beyond HIPC Completion .....  | 111 |
| 4.     | Perception by the National and International Public .....                                 | 114 |
| 5.     | Model Character and Comparability of Ghana's HIPC Process with other HIPC Countries ..... | 118 |
| 5.1.   | Prescribed Policy Reforms .....   | 119 |
| 5.2.   | PRSP Process.....   | 120 |
| 5.3.   | Implementation of HIPC Reforms .....  | 124 |
| 5.4.   | Board Approval.....   | 126 |
| 6.     | Findings.....   | 128 |

## **Part II. Doctrinal Reconstruction of HIPC in a Public International Law Perspective.....**

|        |   |     |
|--------|---|-----|
| 1.     | The Legal Quality of the HIPC Program under the Law of IMF and IDA .....                      | 136 |
| 1.1.   | Decision-Making by the Board of Governors and the Executive Directors .....                   | 137 |
| 1.2.   | Decision-Making by the Development Committee.....   | 140 |
| 1.3.   | Obligations of IMF and IDA Member States under the HIPC Program.....                          | 141 |
| 1.4.   | Legal Effects of Board Decisions on the Domestic Law of Member States .....                   | 145 |
| 1.5.   | Legal Effects of Decisions Interpreting the Articles of Agreement .....                       | 146 |
| 1.6.   | Conclusion.....   | 148 |
| 2.     | Legal Relationship Between the HIPC Debtor and the International Financial Institutions ..... | 150 |
| 2.1.   | Contractual Obligations.....  | 150 |
| 2.1.1. | Letter of Intent under the Fund's PRGF Arrangement .....                                      | 150 |
| 2.1.2. | Relief Disbursements under the Trust Funds.....   | 154 |
| 2.1.3. | HIPC (Relevant) Documents .....   | 155 |
| 2.2.   | Obligations under the IMF and World Bank's Institutional Law.....                             | 157 |

Max-Planck-Institut für  
ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht

---

Beiträge zum ausländischen öffentlichen Recht und Völkerrecht 202

Leonie F. Guder

# The Administration of Debt Relief by the International Financial Institutions

## A Legal Reconstruction of the HIPC Initiative

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 2.2.1. The IMF's Doctrine of Uniform Treatment .....  | 158 |
| 2.2.2. Equality of Treatment under the Bank Articles .....  | 160 |
| 2.3. International Obligations of the Fund and the Bank<br>under the ICESCR and an Evolving International<br>Development Agenda ..... | 161 |
| 2.4. Conclusion.....  | 171 |
| 3. Legal Relationship Between the HIPC Debtor and its Bi- und<br>Multilateral Creditors .....   | 172 |
| 3.1. Paris Club Commitments.....  | 172 |
| 3.1.1. Practices and Proceedings for Paris Club Debt<br>Reschedulings.....  | 173 |
| 3.1.2. Legal Effects of Paris Club Reschedulings under<br>the HIPC Program .....  | 176 |
| 3.2. G-8 Commitments.....   | 179 |
| 4. Legal Relationship between the HIPC Debtor and non-Paris<br>Club and Commercial Creditors .....                                    | 180 |
| 4.1. The London Club .....  | 180 |
| 4.2. HIPC Creditor Litigation .....   | 182 |
| 4.2.1. Claims by Non-Paris Club Members .....   | 182 |
| 4.2.2. Commercial Creditor Litigation .....   | 185 |
| 4.2.3. Booker plc v. Co-operative Republic of Guyana....  | 187 |
| 4.2.4. Pari Passu Clause .....  | 188 |
| 5. Conclusion: "Beyond the Radar Screen of International Law" ....  | 190 |

### **Part III. Multilateral Debt Relief Under HIPC – Global Governance Perspectives .....** 195

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Global Governance .....  | 196 |
| 2. A Global Administrative Law Perspective on HIPC.....                           | 205 |
| 2.1. Descriptive Account: HIPC as a Global Administrative<br>Law Phenomenon ..... | 207 |
| 2.2. Institutional Framework for Administrating Debt Relief ...                   | 211 |
| 2.3. Substantive Requirements .....   | 212 |
| 2.4. Regulatory Procedure.....  | 215 |
| 2.5. Means of Regulation .....  | 217 |
| 2.6. Means of Enforcement.....  | 219 |
| 2.6.1. The Official Incentive Structure of the HIPC<br>Program .....              | 220 |
| 2.6.2. Joint Bank-Fund Conditionality .....                                       | 220 |
| 2.6.3. The Role of Supplementary Financiers.....                                  | 221 |
| 2.6.4. The Signalling Effect of IMF and World Bank<br>Participation .....         | 222 |