

NATIONAL JOURNAL OF ♦♦ REVUE NATIONALE DE

**CONSTITUTIONAL ♦♦ DROIT  
LAW ♦♦ CONSTITUTIONNEL**

**22.1**

---

Vol. 22 No. 1 December/décembre 2007 22 NJCL 1-118

---

**ARTICLES**

EUGENE MEEHAN Q.C., ROBERT CHIARELLI AND MARIE-FRANCE MAJOR,  
The Constitutional Legal Status of Municipalities 1849-2004: Success is a Journey,  
But Also a Destination/1-60

ERROL MENDES, The *Charter* and Its Constitutional Lineage:  
An Evolving Template of Distributive Justice for Reconciling Diversity,  
Collective Rights of National Minorities and Individual Rights/61-92

WYVY GO, Whose *Charter* is it anyways? An examination of *Charter* litigation  
as it relates to the Chinese Canadian community/93-118

**THOMSON**  
—★—  
**CARSWELL**

# **The Constitutional Legal Status of Municipalities 1849-2004: Success is a Journey, But Also a Destination**

*Eugene Meehan, Q.C., Robert Chiarelli and Marie-France Major\**

## **Table of Contents**

1. INTRODUCTION: CITY-STATES & NATION-STATES .....	4
2. THE MUNICIPAL URBAN MOSAIC: SNAPSHOT OF TODAY'S REALITY .....	5
(a) Canada is an Urban Country .....	6
(b) Urban Regions are the Most Powerful Economic Engines of the Country .....	7
(c) Financial Constraints and Downloading – Creating a Need for More Sources of Revenue .....	7
(d) Municipalities Have Become More – Not Less – Important: Urban Areas Are Where People Live, Work and Play (or is that Live, Work and Pay?) .....	10

---

\* Eugene Meehan, Q.C., LL.B. (Edinburgh), LL.M. (McGill), LL.B. (Ottawa), D.C.L. (McGill) Barrister and Solicitor (Ontario, Alberta, N.W.T., Yukon, Nunavut) U.S. Attorney (State Bar of Arizona) Lang Michener, Ottawa. Robert Chiarelli, B. Bus. Admin. (Clarkson University), LL.B. (University of Ottawa) Barrister and Solicitor (Ontario), Former Mayor, City of Ottawa. Marie-France Major, B. Sc. Soc. (Ottawa), LL.B. (Ottawa), B.C.L. (Oxon), J.S.D. (Berkeley), Barrister and Solicitor (Ontario) Lang Michener, Ottawa.

- 3. DEFINING MUNICIPAL CORPORATIONS ..... 10
- 4. MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT: AN EXAMPLE OF REAL RESPONSIVE DEMOCRACY IN ACTION ..... 11
- 5. PURPOSE/ROLE OF MUNICIPALITIES – FROM SERVICE PROVIDER TO MAKER OF LOCAL POLICY .... 13
- 6. THE CONSTITUTIONAL STATUS OF MUNICIPALITIES – NO CHANGE SINCE 1849 ..... 14
- 7. COURT ADJUDICATION: DEFINING THE POWERS OF MUNICIPALITIES ..... 19
  - (a) Municipalities are Creatures of Provincial Legislatures – Children “Listen Up” ..... 19
  - (b) Review of Local Government Actions – “Here’s How We Think You Should Act” ..... 22
- 8. IMPACT OF SUBORDINATE ROLE – IT’S LIKE HAVING BOTH HANDS TIED BEHIND ONE’S BACK ..... 30
  - (a) Provincial Governments Slowly Peck Away at Municipal Autonomy ..... 30
  - (b) Real Limitations on Municipal Governments to Meet Real Challenges ..... 31
- 9. THE UNANSWERED CALL FOR CHANGE ..... 32
  - (a) It All Started Back in 1839 ..... 32
  - (b) Let’s Change Things – Isn’t It About Time? ..... 33
- 10. INSPIRATION FROM ABROAD – SELF-GOVERNANCE IS THE KEY ..... 36
  - (a) Local Governments Are a Separate Order of Government ..... 36
  - (b) European Charter of Local Self-Government ..... 37

11. CHANGING THE COLOURS ON THE CANVAS – RECOGNISING AND EXPANDING MUNICIPAL AUTHORITY AND AUTONOMY .....	38
(a) Provincial Flexibility .....	38
12. SUPREME COURT OF CANADA MANDATES CHANGES .....	40
(a) Respecting Legitimate Choices of Municipalities .....	40
(b) Municipalities are Socially and Politically Important .....	43
13. THE TIMES THEY ARE A-FINALLY CHANGING – SUPREME COURT OF CANADA ADOPTS AND RECOGNIZES THE “SUBSIDIARITY” PRINCIPLE .....	43
(a) No Longer Mere Creatures of Provincial Governments .....	43
(b) Taking a Cue from the Supreme Court – Deference to Municipal Authority and Decisions .....	45
14. ‘NO TAXATION WITHOUT REPRESENTATION’, AND NO CHANGE WITHOUT CONSULTATION – REVISITING <i>EAST YORK</i> .....	47
(a) Impact of Constitutional Convention .....	49
(b) Extent of Constitutional Convention .....	50
15. GETTING PRACTICAL: MOVING FORWARD .....	50
(a) What Others are Doing .....	52
(b) Potential Financial Tools .....	54
(c) Personal and Corporate Income Tax .....	55
(i) <i>Revenue Required to Meet Obligations, Demands and             Needs</i> .....	55
(ii) <i>Responding to Challenge</i> .....	56
(d) No Disputing Deference Demanded for Determining and Defining Municipal Authority .....	56
(i) <i>The Guiding Light</i> .....	56
(ii) <i>General Welfare Powers: Additional and Distinct             Sources of Authority for Municipalities</i> .....	57
16. CONCLUSION .....	58