## **Contents**

Legislation	587
Companies and Corporate Bodies	
Companies (Amendment) Act 2003 (Singapore)	587
Strategic Goods (Control) Act 2002 (Singapore)	588
Constitutional Law and Human Rights	
Freedom of Information Ordinance 2002 (Pakistan)	588
Criminal Law and Procedure	
Financial Intelligence and Anti-Money Laundering Act 2002 (Mauritius)	589
Prevention of Corruption Act 2002 (Mauritius)	590
Crimes Legislation Amendment (People Smuggling, Firearms	390
Trafficking and Other Measures) Act 2002 (Australia)	592
Crime (International Co-operation) Act 2003 (United Kingdom)	594
Proceeds of Crime Act 2002 (United Kingdom)	596
Proceeds of Crime Act 2002 (Officed Kingdom)	390
Finance, Trade and Economic Development	
Consumer Protection Act 2002 (Barbados)	597
Fair Competition Act 2002 (Barbados)	599
Land	
Land Titles (Amendment) Act 2003 (Singapore)	602
Judicial Decisions	603
(see also under Legal Profession)	
Appeal — Supreme Court — special leave to appeal — judicial review — Director of Public Prosecutions taking over private	
prosecution and entering nolle prosequi — application for leave to apply for judicial review dismissed by Court of Appeal —	
application for special leave to appeal to Supreme Court — statute specifying different criteria for grant of special leave in	
civil and criminal cases respectively — whether matter civil or criminal — whether raising matters of substantial general interest	
to administration of civil justice — whether special leave to be	
granted — Supreme Court Act 1998, s. 7(3) — High Court Rules,	
Ord 53 — Penal Code (Cap 17), s. 117	
Administrative law — judicial review — Director of Public	
Prosecutions — prosecutorial discretion — Director of Public	

Constitutional Law and Human Rights

Constitutional law — constitution — amendment — separation of powers — executive power — president — sovereignty — executive power of the people to be exercised by president — parliament — dissolution — president possessing power to dissolve parliament — whether such power inalienable — bill proposing transfer of such power to parliament itself in certain circumstances — whether such transfer allowed — appropriate test — relevant considerations — Constitution of the Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka 1978, Arts 3, 4, 62(2), 70, 123(2)(c) — 19th Amendment to the Constitution Bill, cll 3–5

Constitutional law — constitution — suspension — amendment — parliament having no power to suspend operation of constitutional provision — constitutional amendment required to specify provisions affected — proposed amendment having effect of suspending operation of constitutional provision without such specification — whether such amendment could be validly enacted — Constitution of the Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka 1978, Arts 75, 82(1), 99(13)(a) — 19th Amendment to the Constitution Bill, cl 6. (Sri Lanka)

Re 19th Amendment to the Constitution [2003] 4 LRC 290 (SC) Civil and political rights — Equal opportunity — School excluded student who exhibited antisocial and violent behaviour — Behaviour was consequence of disability — Whether school discriminated against student — (CTH) Disability Discrimination Act 1992 ss. 3, 4, 5, 22, 55

Words and phrases — "disability" — "discrimination" (Australia) Federal Court of Australia (Spender, Gyles and Conti JJ)

Fundamental rights — application — "individual" — "person" — constitution protecting fundamental rights and freedoms of "the individual" — limited company claiming protection — whether protection extending to artificial persons — appropriate test — relevant considerations — Constitution of Gibraltar 1969, ss. 1, 15

Fundamental rights — right to privacy — confidentiality — exceptions — regulation of financial services — foreign regulatory authority and magistrate requesting assistance of Financial Services Commissioner in course of investigations into alleged illegal business conduct — commissioner gathering information and records of claimant company and deciding to disclose them to regulatory authority — apparent duty of mutual assistance between regulatory authority and magistrate — information passed to regulatory authority also going to person undertaking criminal investigation — whether decision to disclose contravening claimant company's constitutional right to privacy — appropriate test — relevant considerations —

616

Secretariat Legal Publications	Inside Back
7th Commonwealth Law Moot	996
An Overview of the Proceeds of Crime Act 2002 (Ivan Pearce, Barrister)	986
Court of Australia)  An Overview of the Presseds of Crime Act 2002	
Michael Kirby, AC, CMG, Justice of the High	976
Judicial Integrity: A Global Social Contract (The Hon Justice	901
The Lesotho Corruption Trials — A Case Study (Fiona Darroch, Barrister at law, London)	901
Articles and Notes	901
Auticles and Neter	001
First Annual Report of the President of the Special Court for Sierra Leone: 2 December 2002 — 1 December 2003	891
UN: Security Council Resolution on the situation in Liberia UN: Security Council Resolution on the situation in Afghanistan	884 890
UN: Security Council Resolution on Libya	883
League of Arab States: Beirut Declaration	882
United States-Russian Federation: Moscow Treaty on Strategic Offensive Reductions	
United Nations Convention against Corruption	847
African Union Convention On Preventing and Combating Corruption	4
•	832
Council of Europe: Additional Protocol to the Criminal Law Convention on Corruption	922
International Developments	832
Victims of Crime: Best Practice Guidelines for the Commonwealth	823
Conclusion	822
Treatment of Child Victims	821
Research and Database	819
Prevention Strategies Assistance to Victims of Trafficking	813 817
on Trafficking	806
Toward a Gender — Responsive, Rights — Based Perspective	
Overview	803
Trafficking of Women and Children  Background: Trafficking in Countries of the Commonwealth: An	
Report of the Expert Group on Strategies for Combating the	

xxviii

whether medical reports contained evidence of objective symptoms — whether trial judge erred in failing to give weight to medical reports

Courts and judicial system — appeal — whether new point or issue raised on appeal which was not taken at trial — consideration of conduct of trial to determine whether new point raised on appeal

Courts and judicial system — appeal — finding by Court of Appeal that substantial wrong or miscarriage of justice had taken place at trial on basis that trial judge had not properly considered plaintiff's case — whether Court of Appeal erred in holding that trial judge had not properly considered plaintiff's case — Supreme Court Rules Pt 51 r 23 (Australia)

Whisprun Pty Ltd (formerly Northwest Exports Pty Ltd) v Dixon (2003) 200 ALR 447 (HC of A)

Contempt — contempt of court — penalties — relevance of partial compliance with court order — relevance of award of indemnity costs in assessing penalty (Australia)

Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Union v BHP Steel (AIS) Pty Ltd (2003) 196 ALR 350 (FCA)

Evidence — claim for confidentiality — application under s. 209 of Workplace Relations Act 1996 (Cth) — order sought under s. 50 of Federal Court of Australia Act 1976 (Cth) prohibiting publishing of evidence — principle of open justice — public interest — prior disclosure of evidence — evidence affecting reputation of elected union official — general nature of evidence widely known — publication likely to cause embarrassment to applicant and family — (CTH) Federal Court of Australia Act 1976

Practice and procedure — application for leave to appeal — whether leave should be granted — whether trial judge erred in exercise of discretion — whether decision of primary judge attended with sufficient doubt to warrant reconsideration by Full Court — whether substantial injustice would result if leave refused and decision erroneous

Johnston v Cameron and Others (2003) 195 ALR 300 (FC of A)

## Criminal Law and Procedure

Drug trafficking — conspiracy to import controlled drugs — alternate counts specifying different classes of drugs — whether conviction can be justified when evidence does not exclusively establish class of drugs — Section 6 of Misuse of Drugs Act 1975 (New Zealand)

Karpavicius v R [2002] UKPC 59 (PC)

Criminal law — criminal procedure — prosecution — authority to prosecute — persons entitled to conduct prosecution — offences under Queensland Criminal Code and Corporations Law of Queensland — indictment presented by Commonwealth Director of Public Prosecutions

647

649

650

651

xii

order of detention at governor-general's pleasure (Jamaica)  Director of Public Prosecutions v Mollison (No. 2) [2003] 2  WLR 1160	640
Contract	
Contract — illegal contracts — agreements contrary to public policy — maintenance and champerty — champertous maintenance is giving of assistance to litigant by person without interest in action or legally recognized motive for doing so, in consideration for share of proceeds of action — attorney/client conditional (normal or uplift) fee agreement not contrary to public policy Criminal Law — maintenance and champerty — reception of English law — common law offences of maintenance and champerty part of Cayman law (although now abolished in England) — imported by original English settlers in 1734 as suitable to their circumstances	
Attorneys-at-Law — remuneration — conditional fee agreement — normal and uplift fees valid and enforceable subject to court's approval, provided no agreement to share proceeds of action (outright contingency feé) — public policy objections based on maintenance outweighed by benefits of access to justice — need not provide for other side's costs — approval may be conditional, e.g. on taxation of costs (Cayman Islands)  Quayum and Others v Hexagon Trust Company (Cayman Islands) Ltd [2002] CILR 161 (GC)	* 642
Damages — assessment — proof of damage — whether claimant failed to prove amount of loss it had sustained as result of breach of contract — whether method of calculation or assessment of damages by trial judge was flawed or erroneous Evidence — admissions — admission on pleadings (Australia)  Placer (Granny Smith) Pty Ltd v Theiss Contractors Pty Ltd (2003) 196 ALR 257 (HCA)	645
Courts Pratice and Procedure  Civil procedure — costs — costs as damages — no power to award as damages costs unrecovered under party and party costs order — different restrictions apply to awards of costs and damages  Civil procedure — costs — indemnity basis — available in exceptional circumstances when unsuccessful party has abused process of court, e.g. deliberately misleading court by giving false evidence (Cayman Islands)	
Nike Real Estate Ltd v De Bruyne, De Cuyper and International Relocation Group Ltd [2002] CILR 31 (GC)  Evidence — expert evidence — medical reports — finding that plaintiff not credible — whether medical reports had evidentiary value independent of credibility finding against plaintiff —	646
	xi

— plaintiff bringing action for damages against bank — bank's collections error cause of account falling into arrears — bank's subsequent demand for repayment cause of lapse of life insurance — breach of contract resulting in award of damages (Canada) Valentine v Toronto-Dominion Bank (2003) 218 DLR (4th) 225 (CA)  Torts — negligence — duty of care — scope — infant ward of children's aid society setting fire to plaintiff's home — plaintiff bringing action for damages against children's aid society — society knowing ward needed constant supervision and psychological help — failing to provide counselling or supervision — proximity of relationship existed between plaintiff and society — society's decisions purely operational in nature — society owed duty of care — breach of duty warranted finding of liability — Child and Family Services Act, R.S.O. 1990  Crown — liability — tort — infant ward of children's aid society setting fire to plaintiff's home — plaintiff bringing action for damages against children's aid society — society knowing ward needed constant supervision and psychological help — failing to provide counselling or supervision — proximity of relationship existed between plaintiff and society — society's decisions purely operational in nature — society owed duty of care — breach of duty warranted finding of liability — plaintiff bringing action for damages against foster parent — foster parent acting in good faith in taking ward into her home — statutory exemption prevented finding of liability — Child and Family Services Act, R.S. 1990 (Canada)  Yelle v Children's Aid Society of Ottawa-Carleton (2003) 218	705
DLR (4th) 168 (SCJ)	707
Law Reform	709
Finance, trade & economic development E-commerce (Tanzania)	709
Tort Uniform Liens Act (Canada — British Columbia)	717
Trusts and Trustees Creditor Access to the Assets of a Purpose Trust (Canada — British Columbia) Variation and Termination of Trusts (Canada — British Columbia)	728 733
Legal Profession	752
Judicial Decisions Court — jurisdiction — Federal Court — whether court having	

Court — jurisdiction — Federal Court — whether court having jurisdiction to set aside previous order — rules of the Federal Court 1995, r 137

xxii

Prosecutions taking over private prosecution and entering nolle prosequi — whether decision subject to judicial review — whether principles of judicial review applying — appropriate test — relevant considerations — Constitution of Fiji 1990

Criminal law — perjury — affidavits of evidence — affidavits sworn before Commissioner of Oaths for use in judicial proceedings — statements therein alleged to be false — whether such affidavits within statutory definition of perjury — Penal Code (Cap 17), s.117 (Fiji)

Matalulu and Another v DPP [2003] 4 LRC 712 (Supreme Court)

Administrative law — judicial review — professional services review — investigative referral by Health Insurance Commission — adjudicative referral by director to Professional Services Review Committee — whether error of law or failure to take into account relevant consideration in making investigative referral — whether denial of procedural fairness — Scope of power under s. 106KA of Health Insurance Act 1973 (Cth) — (CTH) Health Insurance Act 1973 s. 106KA

Medicine — health services — medical practitioners — professional services review — investigative referral by Health Insurance Commission — adjudicative referral by director to Professional Services Review Committee — whether director entitled to rely on "80/20 rule" to make adjudicative referral — whether director must investigate all services in 2 year referral period — (CTH) Health Insurance Act 1973 ss. 81, 86, 92, 106KA — Health Insurance (Professional Services Review) Regulations reg 10 (Australia)

Daniel v Kelly (in his capacity as Acting Director of Professional Services Review) and Others (2003) 200 ALR 379 (FC of A)

Administrative law — appeals — scope of appeal — standard of review — factual findings of securities commission reviewable on standard of reasonableness — in absence of any order or ruling by securities commission, Court of Appeal had no jurisdiction to review commission's finding that an individual was a de facto director of a corporation — Securities Act, R.S.B.C. 1996, c. 418, ss. 1, definition "decision", 167(1)

Criminal law — securities offences — securities commission's power to order administrative penalty in public interest to be exercised to restrain future conduct of individual in question — where breach relatively minor and commission found that individual was not a threat to integrity of capital markets, commission's imposition of maximum penalty counterintuitive — on appeal, penalty reduced from \$100,000 to \$10,000 — Securities Act, R.S.B.C. 1996, c. 418, s. 162 (Canada)

Cartaway Resources Corp (Re) (2003) 218 DLR (4th) 470 (SC)

603

607

Bankruptcy and Insolvency			
Bankruptcy — Public examination — Criminal proceedings on foot — Whether examination should be deferred pending hearing of criminal proceedings — (CTH) Bankruptcy Act 1966 s. 81(11)			
(Australia)  Cohen and Another v Prentice (2003) 196 ALR 45 (FMC of A)	610		•
Insolvency — inquiry into company's dealings — production of			
documents — application by official receiver — documents intended for use in disqualification proceedings against directors — whether proper exercise of statutory power — whether order to be made — Insolvency Act 1986 (c 45), s. 236(2) — Company			
Directors Disqualification Act 1986 (c 46), s. 7(4) (United Kingdom)			
In re Pantamaenog Timber Co Ltd [2003] 3 WLR 767 (HL(E))	611		
Companies and Corporate Bodies			
Trade and commerce — trade practices — exclusionary provision — merger of competing sporting competitions — provision			
nominated maximum number of teams to participate in merged			
competition — whether provision in merger agreement			
exclusionary — whether provision included purpose of preventing, restricting or limiting supply of services to, or	**		
acquisition of services from, particular persons or class of			
persons — whether purpose subjective or objective — (CTH)	*		
Trade Practices Act 1974			
Practice and procedure — interveners — argument advanced on appeal by intervener not accepted by parties — argument put on			
appeal contrary to manner in which case pleaded and conducted		•	
Words and phrases — "purpose" — "particular persons or classes of			
persons" (Australia)  News Ltd and Others v South Sydney District Rugby League			
Football Club and Others (2003) 200 ALR 157 (HC of A)	612		
Companies — compulsory winding up — restraining winding up —			
petition by minority shareholder not restrained if only way to			
realize shareholding subject to restrictions on disposal, in absence of fair offer to purchase — fair valuation of share in quasi-			
partnership to be based on notional sale of whole business to			
outside purchaser without discount for lesser value of minority			
shareholding Companies — compulsory winding up — restraining winding up —			
petition by minority shareholder excluded from participation in			
quasi-partnership not abuse of process, even if offer of liquidation			
value for shares refused —no provision in Companies Law enabling court to force purchase of shares at fair value (Cayman			
Islands)			
CVC/Opportunity Equity Partners Ltd and Opportunity Invest II			
Ltd v Demarco Almeida [2002] CILR 77 (PC)	614		
	••	American American	
		•	

·

## Commonwealth Law Bulletin

Volume 29

No. 2

2003

page	
V	Contents
587	Legislation
603	Judicial Decisions
709	Law Reform
752	Legal Profession
779	Commonwealth Developments
832	International Developments
901	Article
901	The Lesotho Corruption Trials — A Case Study
976	Judicial Integrity: A Global Social Contract
986	An Overview of the Proceeds of Crime Act 200
996	7th Commonwealth Law Moot
IRC	Secretariat Legal Publications



Commonwealth Secretariat

Constitution of Gibraltar 1969, ss. 1(c), 6 — Financial Services Ordinance 1989, s. 58 (Gibraltar)

R (on the application of a Gibraltar company) v Financial Services Commissioner [2003] 4 LRC 133 (SC)

Fundamental rights — infringement — validity — right to vote — limitation — prisoners — statute disqualifying prisoners serving sentences of two years or more from voting in federal elections — Crown conceding that provision infringing right to vote — whether infringement justified in free and democratic society — appropriate test — relevant considerations — Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms 1982, ss. 1, 3, 15 — Canada Elections Act, RSC 1985, s. 51(e) (Canada)

Sauve v Canada (Chief Electoral Officer); McCorrister v A-G of Canada and Others [2003] 4 LRC 197 (SC)

Fundamental rights — special rights of citizens — right to hold public office and exercise public functions — qualified right — restrictions permitted — Constitution permitting statutory regulation of right — Acts of Parliament purporting to regulate right — whether amounting to prohibition of exercise of right — whether Acts complying with constitutional requirements — whether reasonably justifiable in a democratic society — whether satisfying procedural requirement — whether unconstitutional and invalid — National Capital District Commission (Amendment) Act 2001 — National Capital District Commission (Amendment No. 2) Act 2001 — Constitution of Papua New Guinea 1975, ss. 38–39, 50 (Papua New Guinea)

Supreme Court Reference (No. 4 of 2001), re Bill Skate MP [2003] 4 LRC 24 Papua New Guinea (SC)

Constitution — local government — organic law providing for provincial and local-level government — executive government having power to apply organic law to National Capital District (NCD) — government of NCD established by Act of Parliament — whether Act inconsistent with organic law — whether valid — Constitution of Papua New Guinea 1975, s. 4(4) — organic Law on provincial governments and local-level governments — National Capital District Commission Act 2001

Fundamental rights — right to equality — local government — different legislative treatment of National Capital District (NCD) — organic law providing for provincial and local-level government — government of NCD established by Act of Parliament — whether amendments discriminating against citizens in the NCD — MPs ex officio members of local-level authorities — MPs for NCD excluded from such membership — whether amounting to discrimination — whether infringing fundamental rights — Constitution of Papua New Guinea 1975, s. 4(4), 55 — Organic Law on provincial governments and

621

625

local-level governments — National Capital District Commission Act 2001

Supreme Court Reference (No. 12 of 2001), re Bill Skate MP (No. 2) [2003] 4 LRC 44 (SC)

Constitution — basic structure — legislatures — membership — representative government — "floor-crossing" — proportional representation - party list system - anti-defection clause in interim constitution — member losing seat in legislature upon ceasing to be member of nominating party - parliament enacting legislation allowing elected members to retain seats after changing party allegiance — whether such legislation inconsistent with constitution or multi-party democracy whether proportional representation and supporting anti-defection provisions fundamental to constitutional order — whether legislation infringing right to vote in free and fair elections whether invalid - Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1993, Sch 4, Constitutional Principle VIII — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, ss.1, 46, 74 — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Amendment Act 2002 - Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Second Amendment Act 2002 -Local Government: Municipal Structures Amendment Act 2002 - Loss or Retention of Membership of National and Provincial Legislatures Act 2002

Constitution — amendment — legislatures — membership — Parliament vested with special power to amend certain transitional provisions of interim Constitution by Act of Parliament, rather than by constitutional amendment — power to be exercised "within a reasonable period" — Parliament passing amendment by Act more than five years after Constitution came into force — relevant provision having only two more years to run — whether amendment made within a reasonable period — whether invalid — Constitution of the republic of South Africa 1993, Sch 2, item 23A — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, s. 76 — Loss or Retention of Membership of National and Provincial Legislatures Act 2002

Enforcement — remedies — constitutional amendments — legislatures — membership — floor-crossing — validity of amendments challenged in legal proceedings — interim court orders suspending operation of amendments pending judgment — validity of amendments ultimately upheld — window period prescribed for floor-crossing having expired meanwhile — appropriate order to be made — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, s. 172(1) (South Africa)

United Democratic Movement v President of the Republic of South Africa and Others (No. 1) [2003] 4 LRC 98 (CC)

of Magistrates Commission inconsistent with constitution — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, s. 178(1) — Magistrates Act, s. 3

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — Magistrates Commission — membership — legislative power of executive to withdraw appointment of member after consultation if "in his or her or its opinion there [were] sound reasons for doing so" — whether objective test — whether inconsistent with judicial independence — appropriate remedy — Magistrates Act, s. 3(2)

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — complaints system — constitution providing that national legislation to provide for procedures for dealing with complaints about judicial officers — legislation providing for complaints system — complaints mechanism for magistrates set out in regulations — whether inconsistent with constitution — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, ss. 180, 239 — Magistrates' Act, s. 6A — complaints procedure regulations

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — appointment — legislation giving minister power to appoint magistrates after consulting Magistrates Commission — whether infringing principle of separation of powers — whether inconsistent with judicial independence — Magistrates Act, s. 10 — Magistrates' Courts Act, s. 9

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — conditions of service — legislation giving minister power to make regulations regarding conditions of service of judicial officers — whether inconsistent with constitution — whether magistrates' conditions of service to be set out in Act of Parliament — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, ss. 174(7) — Magistrates' Act, ss. 4(a), 16(1)

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — removal — grounds for removal — legislation specifying such grounds — degree of protection differing from that provided to judicial officers of higher courts — whether inconsistent with judicial independence — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, s. 194(1)(a) — Magistrates' Act

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — suspension — legislation giving Magistrates Commission power to suspend magistrate pending investigation — procedure — minister given power to determine payment of salary on suspension — parliament having power to recommend removal of magistrate from office — whether

provisions inconsistent with judicial independence — Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, ss. 177 — Magistrates' Act, s. 13(3), (4)

- Constitutional law judiciary independence constitutional protection magistrates misconduct sanction legislation giving minister power to determine appropriate sanction whether inconsistent with judicial independence regulations for judicial Officers in the Lower Courts 1993, reg 26(17)
- Constitutional law judiciary independence constitutional protection magistrates legislation giving minister power to make regulations conferring judicial and administrative powers on magistrates whether inconsistent with separation of powers whether inconsistent with judicial independence Magistrates Act, s. 14(2)
- Constitutional law judiciary independence constitutional protection magistrates appointment of acting or temporary magistrates security of tenure form of agreement legislation giving minister power to appoint a "competent person" to act in regional or district court whether inconsistent with judicial independence Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, s. 175 Magistrates Act, s. 9(3), (4), (J)
- Constitutional law judiciary independence constitutional protection magistrates legislation giving minister power to prohibit additional or assistant magistrates from performing powers conferred or duties imposed on magistrates whether inconsistent with judicial independence Magistrates Act, s. 12(2)
- Constitutional law procedure High Court order of invalidity of sections of Magistrates Act whether Constitutional Court had jurisdiction to confirm or not confirm regulations Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, s. 172(2)(d)
- Constitutional law judiciary independence constitutional protection magistrates applicants convicted or charged before magistrates courts subsequent court orders that provisions of relevant legislation inconsistent with judicial independence appropriate remedy for applicants Magistrates Act, s. 12(2) (South Africa)

Van Rooyen and Others v State and Others [2003] 1 LRC 533

Practice — discovery — privilege — legal advice privilege — action alleging misfeasance in public office in respect of defendant's supervision of bank — internal documents produced for inquiry into supervision of bank — legal advice taken in relation to inquiry — application for disclosure of internal documents — whether documents sent to solicitors or prepared for purpose of obtaining legal advice privileged (United Kingdom)

Three Rivers District Council and Others v Governor and Company of the Bank of England (No. 5) [2003] 3 WLR 667

755

764

XXV

Prisons — prisoners' rights — visit by legal advisers — claimant remanded in custody pending sentence — claimant instructing Italian avvocato — prison governor refusing avvocato access to claimant — whether avvocato "legal adviser" — whether refusal to allow prison visits infringing claimant's Convention rights — whether governor acting unlawfully — Courts and Legal Services Act 1990 (c 41), ss. 27, 28 — Human Rights Act 1998 (c 42), s. 3, Sch 1, Ft 1, Art 6 — European Communities (Services of Lawyers) Order 1978 (SI 1978/1910), Arts 2, 5 — Prison Rules 1999 (United Kingdom)	
Regina (Van Hoogstraten) v Governor of Belmarsh Prison [2003] 1 WLR 263 Queen's Bench Division (Jackson J)  Solicitor — discipline — disciplinary tribunal — tribunal finding no prima facie case — whether duty to give reasons — proper parties to appeal — whether tribunal to be notified (United Kingdom)	764
Lucas v Millman (Practice Note) [2003] 1 WLR 271  Solicitor — costs — solicitor acting on own account — solicitor represented by own firm — whether entitled to recover firm's costs (United Kingdom)	766
Malkinson v Trim [2003] 1 WLR 463	767
Barrister — duty — acceptance of instructions — debtor objecting to petitioner's counsel in bankruptcy proceedings — debtor's wife having known petitioner's counsel socially some years earlier — whether counsel having to make disclosure to other party or court — whether jurisdiction to restrain counsel from appearing — whether test of apparent judicial bias applicable (United Kingdom) — Geveran Trading Co Ltd v Skjevesland [2003] 1 WLR 912  Contempt of court — High Court — summary jurisdiction — litigant causing serious disturbance during proceedings in High Court — judge committing litigant to prison pending summary determination of alleged contempt in face of court — whether jurisdiction to detain alleged contempt beyond day of alleged contempt — whether contempt hearing to be conducted by different judge	768
Contempt of court — committal order — appeal — breach of non-molestation order — county court judge imposing suspended committal order — whether appeal against order requiring permission — CPR r 52.3 (1)(a) (United Kingdom) Wilkinson v S and Another [2003] 1 WLR 1254  Costs — discretion of court — indemnity basis — defendant rejecting claimant's pre-action offer to settle on 95:5 liability split — judgment holding defendant 100% liable — whether pre-litigation offer constituting Part 36 offer — whether costs	769

recoverable on indemnity basis (United Kingdom)

Defamation — privilege — qualified — Bar Council mistakenly believing claimants not to be solicitors and entitled to instruct

770

Huck v Robson [2003] 1 WLR 1340

xxvi

counsel — belief based on unverified information — Council's communication of belief to members of the Bar — whether occasion of communication protected by qualified privilege (United Kingdom)	
Kearns v General Council of the Bar [2003] 1 WLR 1357  Devolution — Scotland — human rights — right to public bearing before independent and impartial tribunal — clerk of district court advising lay justices on points of law — advice often tendered in private — whether role of clerk undermining independence of court — whether breach of right to public	771
bearing — Scotland Act 1998 (United Kingdom)  Clark v Kelly [2003] 2 WLR 1586  Costs — discretion of court — action settled save as to costs —  Court's approach whether court to determine unresolved substantive issues — whether appropriate to make no order as to costs  Legal aid — costs — successful assisted party — assessment on indemnity basis — whether appropriate to award costs on indemnity basis in favour of assisted party — Civil Legal Aid (General) Regulations 1989 (SI 1989/339), reg 107B as inserted by Civil Legal Aid (General) (Amendment) Regulations 1994 (United Kingdom)	772
Brawley v Marczynski and Another (Nos 1 and 2) [2003] 1 WLR 813  Legal professional privilege — money laundering — whether barristers and solicitors subject to reporting obligations — whether legal requirement to report contravenes LPP — Section 25A Organised and Serious Crime Ordinance (Hong Kong)	773
Pang Yiu Hung Robert v Commissioner of Police and Ngai Shui Kef [2002] HKCFI 1345.	774
<b>Commonwealth Developments</b>	779
Aso Rock Commonwealth Declaration on Development and Democracy: Partnership for Peace and Prosperity	779
Aso Rock Statement on Multilateral Trade	784
Commonwealth Principles on the Accountability of and the Relationship Between the Three Branches of Government	786
Guidelines of Best Practice to Promote Freedom of Expression, Assembly and Association	
Freedom of Expression: Specific Issues	791
Freedom of Assembly and Association	795
Minimum Standards for the Commonwealth	799
Effecting Minimum Standards	800

xxvii

Courts — judiciary — effective date of judgment — three-member panel hearing appeal — judgment reserved — judgment prepared by court — judge retiring prior to delivery of judgment — statute requiring parties' consent to continuation of proceedings in such circumstances — accrued right — statute subsequently amended — parties' consent to continuation of proceedings no longer required — whether former requirement of consent establishing a substantive right — whether accrued right — whether parties vested with right to control proceedings — whether amendment repealing substantive right — whether having retrospective effect — whether pre-amendment provisions protected — Interpretation Acts 1948 and 1967, s. 30(1)(b) — Courts of Judicature Act 1964, s. 78

Judiciary — bias — waiver — applicant losing appeal — applicant alleging apparent bias on part of presiding judge — applicant possessing information relating to bias before judgment delivered — whether applicant having waived right to allege bias (Malaysia) MGG Pillai v Tan Sri Dato' Vincent Tan Chee Yioun [2003] 1 LRC 339 Federal Court (Steve Shim CJ, Siti Norma Yaakob and Haidar FCJJ)

Legal profession — barrister — Queen's Counsel — fees ordinance preventing Queen's Counsel performing functions normally undertaken by solicitors — whether functions performed by Queen's Counsel permitted by English rules of conduct — Legal Practitioners Ordinance 1915, s. 5(3) — bar of England and Wales Code of Conducts (1998)

Legal profession — barrister — Queen's Counsel — fees — whether Queen's Counsel entitled to recover fees by action — Legal Practitioners Ordinance 1915, s. 5(3) (St Lucia)

Husbands v Warefact Ltd [2003] 3 LRC 648

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — constitution giving institutional protection to courts — whether all courts needing same level of protection — whether lesser protection afforded to magistrates' courts than to higher courts unconstitutional — constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996, s. 165(2)

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — legislation providing for appointment, promotion and disciplining of magistrates — whether various provisions consistent with requirement of independence and impartiality of judiciary — appropriate test

Constitutional law — judiciary — independence — constitutional protection — magistrates — Magistrates Commission constituted under legislation to oversee appointment, promotion and disciplining of magistrates — membership — composition of Magistrates Commission differing from constitutionally — founded Judicial Services Commission — whether composition

752

\*