

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

V O L U M E 13

**Timor Leste
The Special Panels for
Serious Crimes 2001-2003**

André Klip and Göran Sluiter (eds.)



intersentia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface by the editors	9
Preface by Justice Rapoza	11
Introduction	15
Part 1 / Preliminary matters	
1. Arrest Warrant / Indictment	
Decision, <i>Prosecutor v. Francisco Pedro</i> , Case No. 1/2001, SPSC, 22 May 2001.	29
Commentary <i>Brianne McGonigle</i>	35
2. Provisional release / detention	
Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2001/1), <i>Prosecutor v. Julio Fernandes</i> (Case No. 2/2000), <i>Carlos Soares Carmona</i> (Case No. 3/2000), <i>Romeiro Tilman, Benjamin Sarmentó</i> (Case No. 18/2001), <i>Joseph Leki</i> (Case No. 5/2000), <i>Mateus Tilman</i> (Case No. 8/2000), <i>Augustino da Costa</i> (Case No. 7/2000), <i>Manuel Goncalves Leto Bere</i> (Case No. 10/2000), <i>Joni Marques, Manuel da Costa, Joao da Costa, Paulo da Costa, Amelio da Costa, Hilario da Silva, Gonsalo dos Santos, Alarico Fernandes, Mautersa Monis, Gilberto Fernandes</i> (Case No. 9/2000), <i>Carlos Soares</i> (Case No. 12/2000) and <i>Anígio de Oliveira</i> (Case No. 7/2001), CoA, 14 February 2001 [Translation by the Editors]. . . .	41
Judgement of Fredrick Egonda-Ntende.	46
The Request for the Release of the Accused Benjamin Sarmentó, Romerio Tilman and Joao Sarmentó, <i>Prosecutor v. Benjamin Sarmentó, Romeiro Tilman, Joao Sarmentó and Domingos Mendonca</i> . Case No. 18/2001, SPSC, 22 March 2002.	51
Decision to the Application for Release of the Accused Jose Cardoso Ferreira alias Muzhino, <i>Prosecutor v Joao Franca da Silva, José Cardoso Ferreira and Sabino Gouveia Leite</i> , Case No. 4/2001, SPSC, 27 April 2002.	59
Decision on the Application of Release of the Accused Salvador Soares aka Salvador Leos Marobo, <i>Prosecutor v Salvador Soares</i> , Case No. 7/2002, SPSC, 16 September 2002.	67
Decision to the Application for Release of the Accused Lino de Carvalho, <i>Prosecutor v. Lino de Carvalho</i> , Case No. 10/2001, SPSC, 28 October 2002.	71
Decision on the Application for Conditional Release of Sabino Gouveia Leite, <i>Prosecutor v. Sabino Gouveia Leite</i> . Case No. 4b/2001, SPSC, 17 December 2002.	77
Decision to the Application for Release of the Accused Abilio Méndez Correia, <i>Prosecutor v. Abilio Méndez Córrela</i> , Case No. 19/2001, SPSC, 10 June 2003.	83
Decision to the Application for Release of the Accused Carlos Ena, <i>Prosecutor v. Carlos Ena</i> , Case No. 5/2002, SPSC, 12 June 2003.	89
Commentary <i>Salvador Zappalá</i>	93

Part 2 / Procedural matters

3. Procedural decisions

Ruling of the Court With Respect to the Request of the Defense Relating to the Interference With the Defense's Witnesses, *Prosecutor v. Salvador Soares*, Case No. 7/2002, SPSC, 16 September 2002. 103

Commentary *Brianne McGonigle*. 109

Part 3 / Judgements

4. Judgements

Sentencing Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Joao Fernandes*, Case No. 1/2000, SPSC, 25 January 2001. 115

Dissenting Judgement of Judge Maria Natércia Gusmão Pereira Regarding the Facts and the Sentencing for Serious Crimes. 120

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Julio Fernandes*, Case No. 2/2000, SPSC, 1 March 2001. 123

Dissenting Decision and Disagreement of Judge Maria Natércia Gusmão Pereira on the Analysis of Facts and Applicable Law. 131

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Carlos Soares Carmona*, Case No. 3/2000, SPSC, 8 March - 25 April 2001. 135

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Leonardus Kasa*, Case No. 11/2000, SPSC, 9 May 2001. 143

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Manuel Goncalves Leto Bere*, Case No. 10/2000, SPSC, 15 May 2001. 149

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Carlos Soares*, Case No. 12/2000, SPSC, 31 May 2001. 159

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Joseph Leki*, Case No. 5/2000, SPSC, 11 June 2001. 169

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Jose Valente*, Case No. 3/2001, SPSC, 19 June 2001. 181

Commentary *Goran Sluiter*. 192

5. Judgements

Judgement, *Prosecutor v Francisco dos Santos Laku*, Case No. 8/2001, SPSC, 25 July 2001. 207

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Mateus Turnan*, Case No. 8/2000, SPSC, 24 August 2001. 217

Judgment, *Prosecutor v. Augusto Asameta Tavares*, Case No. 2/2001, SPSC, 28 September 2001 229

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Augustino da Costa*, Case No. 7/2000, SPSC, 11 October 2001. 239

Commentary *Steven Freeland*. 252

6. Judgements

Judgement, *Prosecutor v. Joni Marques, Manuel da Costa, Joao da Costa, Paulo da Costa, Amelio da Costa, Hilario da Silva, Gonsalo dos Santos, Alerico Fernandes, Mautersa Monis and Gilberto Fernandes*, Case No. 9/2000, SPSC, 11 December 2001. 257

Commentary *Andre Klip*. 505

7. Judgements

Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Anigio de Oliveira</i> , Case No. 7/2001, SPSC, 27 March 2002 [Translation by the Editors]	511
Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Marcurious José de Deus</i> , Case No. 13/2001, SPSC, 18 April 2002.	523
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Augusto dos Santos</i> , Case No. 6/2001, SPSC, 14 May 2002.	531
Final Judgement Pronounced in First Instance, <i>Prosecutor v. Armando dos Santos</i> , Case No. 16/2001, SPSC, 9 September 2002 [Translation by the Editors]	541
Commentary <i>Maria Fernanda Palma Pereira</i>	560

8. Judgements

Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Francisco Soares</i> , Case No. 14/2001, SPSC, 12 September 2002.	567
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Ramos.....	577
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Gaspard Leki</i> , Case No. 5/2001, SPSC, 14 September 2002.	579
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. X</i> , Case No. 4/2002, SPSC, 2 December 2002.	589
Commentary <i>Goreth Kyakuwa</i>	597

9. Judgements

Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Joao Franca da Silva</i> , Case No. 4a/2001, SPSC, 5 December 2002.	609
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Sabino Gouveia Leite</i> , Case No. 4b/2001, SPSC, 7 December 2002.	637
Commentary <i>Kai Ambos and Ousman Njikam</i>	661

10. Judgements

Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. José Cardoso Ferreira</i> , Case No. 4c/2001, SPSC, 5 April 2003.	671
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Agostinho Atolan</i> , Case No. 3/2003, SPSC, 9 June 2003.	755
Commentary <i>Alexander Zahar</i>	762

11. Appeals

Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2001/2), <i>Prosecutor v. Joao Fernandes</i> , Case No. 1/2000, CoA, 29 June 2001.	767
Judgement of Judge Egonda-Ntende.	774
Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2001/9), <i>Prosecutor v. José Cardoso Ferreira</i> , Case No. 4c/2001, CoA, 29 June 2001 [Translation by the Editors]	781
Judgement of Judge Egonda-Ntende.	783
Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2001/17), <i>Prosecutor v. Carlos Soares Carmona</i> , Case No. 3/2000, CoA, 2 August 2001 [Translation by the Editors]	785
Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2001/4, <i>Prosecutor v. Lino de Carvalho</i> , Case No. 10/2001, CoA, 29 October 2001! [Translation by the Editors]	791
Judgement of Judge Egonda-Ntende.	796

Table of Contents

Judgement (Criminal Appeal No. 2001/7), <i>Prosecutor v. Julio Fernandes</i> , Case No. 2/2001, CoA, 29 October 2001 (Translation by the Editors)	801
Judgement of Judge Egonda-Ntende.	808
<i>Commentary Pedro Caeiro</i>	817
Index.	839
Contributors and Editors.	845